

Adalah The Legal Center for Arab Minority Rights in Israel
عدالة المركز القانوني لحقوق الأقليّة العربيّة في إسرائيل
עזאלה המרכז המשפטי לזכויות המיעוט הערבי בישראל



Adalah's Report of Activities 2008

Issued February 2009

P.O. Box 8921 Haifa 31090 Israel Tel: (972)-4-950-1610 Fax: (972)-4-950-3140
חיפה 31090, ס.ב. 8921 הַתַּף 04-9501610 פַּאקס 04-9503140
חַיפָה 31090, ת.ד. 8921 טֵלפּוֹן 04-9501610 פַּקס 04-9503140
Email: adalah@adalah.org <http://www.adalah.org>

Introduction

This report highlights Adalah's **main achievements and impact, as well as our key activities** conducted in 2008, our twelfth year of operation. As this report reflects, Adalah achieved some successes on our legal representations and international advocacy initiatives, and submitted major new impact litigation cases of crucial importance in promoting and defending the rights of Palestinian citizens of Israel and Palestinian residents of the Occupied Palestinian Territory (OPT). Adalah also initiated new strategic partnerships and projects in Israel, the OPT and abroad, in particular in South Africa, and moved to its new offices in Haifa in May 2008.

Adalah ("Justice" in Arabic) is an independent human rights organization with offices in Haifa in the north and Beer el-Sabe (Beer Sheva) in the south. Established in November 1996, Adalah serves Palestinian citizens of Israel, numbering over one million people or close to 20% of the population and Palestinians living in the OPT. Adalah's main objectives are to achieve equal individual and collective rights for the Palestinian Arab minority in Israel in different fields including land and planning rights; civil and political rights; economic, social and cultural rights; religious rights; women's rights; and prisoners' rights, and to defend the rights of Palestinians living under occupation. In order to achieve these goals, Adalah:

- Brings impact litigation cases before Israeli courts and various state authorities;
- Provides legal consultation to individuals, NGOs, and Arab institutions;
- Appeals to international institutions and forums;
- Organizes conferences and study days and publishes reports on legal issues;
- Trains legal apprentices, law students, and new lawyers in the field of human rights.

The report is divided into four sections: Legal Action, International Advocacy, Legal Education and Institutional Development. We have employed a new, more streamlined format for this report, in an attempt to provide readers with a more succinct presentation of our work. We have also added information about major challenges faced by the organization and the strategies that we have employed to meet those challenges.

Legal Action

Highlights

Following Adalah's petition to the Haifa District Court, in 1/08 the state rescinded its decision to appropriate **900 dunams of land belonging to 24 Arab citizens of Israel in Daliyat al-Carmel** to create a national park and forest. As a result of this case, Arab citizens were able to keep their land

http://www.adalah.org/eng/pressreleases/pr.php?file=08_01_14



Pictured: Residents of Daliyat al-Carmel who signed affidavits which were included in Adalah's petition. Photo by Nazih Halaby

In 8/08, following a petition filed by Adalah on behalf of the Association for the Development of Arab Education (ADAE) in Haifa and 33 families, negotiations between Adalah and the Ministry of Education (MOE) and Haifa Municipality led to an agreement to open a first grade class at the **al-Karma school for the arts** in Haifa, from 9/08 for one year. As a result of this case, Dr. Yasser Mansour, the Chairman of the ADAE, and Adalah Attorney Sawsan Zaher were named as two out of the 50 most influential people in the field of education in 2008 by *Ha'aretz* newspaper http://www.adalah.org/eng/pressreleases/pr.php?file=08_08_24

As a result of a petition filed by Adalah to the Supreme Court in 11/08, the AG announced in 12/08 that the state would construct a **safe access road to the schools and health clinic** in the unrecognized Arab Bedouin village of Al-Sayyid in the Naqab after the deaths of four children on the road due to its appalling safety conditions. Around 1,500 pupils attend two elementary schools on the site; the site

also houses 10 pre-schools and a health clinic. The AG also committed that *work would be conducted on constructing roads to all schools and service centers in the unrecognized villages*

http://www.adalah.org/eng/pressreleases/pr.php?file=08_12_17

Adalah represented political party **al-Jabha (Hadash)** on a Supreme Court petition filed by the Movement for Quality Government in Israel demanding that local election results in Sakhnin (pop: 25,000), an Arab town in the north, be cancelled and three party members removed from the local council following the candidacy of a former political prisoner on the al-Jabha list. The Supreme Court rejected the petition in 11/08, and thus al-Jabha secured its elected seats on the local council, including the mayorship

http://www.adalah.org/eng/pressreleases/pr.php?file=08_11_27_1

Figures

	Planned 2008	Achieved 2008
New impact litigation	15	20
New legal interventions	20+	27
Wins/losses	–	6 wins 5 losses
Follow-up on pending cases	–	40+

Major new impact litigation

- *Cases to the courts & planning authorities*

Land and Planning Rights

A petition filed to the Tel Aviv District Court in 6/08 demanding that the Arab village of **Jisr al-Zarqa** (pop: 11,000) be connected to the main coastal highway, as have all neighboring Jewish communities

http://www.adalah.org/eng/pressreleases/pr.php?file=08_06_24

A second appeal filed to the planning authorities in 3/08 against local plan for **Daliyat al-Carmel** (pop: 13,500), which disregards the rights of the town's residents

http://www.adalah.org/eng/pressreleases/pr.php?file=08_03_17_1

A Supreme Court petition filed in 7/08 demanding the return of a 10-dunam plot of **land in Nazareth confiscated by the state** in 1958 for alleged but unfulfilled public purposes. The court rejected Adalah's request for a temporary injunction http://www.adalah.org/eng/pressreleases/pr.php?file=08_07_03

An appeal submitted in 10/08 to the Nazareth District Court and in 12/08 to the Supreme Court to compel Safad Municipality to **connect the Arab neighborhood of Akbara (pop: 2,000) to the town's sewage system**. Update: In 1/09, Safad Municipality authorized a bid for works to connect Akbara to the sewage system <http://www.adalah.org/newsletter/eng/jan09/7.php>

In 10/08, Adalah filed a response to the Supreme Court to an **appeal by Moshav Nevatim** against a District Court decision upholding the right of a Jewish Israeli family to rent their home to an Arab family, despite the moshav's racist objections http://www.adalah.org/eng/pressreleases/pr.php?file=08_11_23

Social, Economic and Education Rights

A petition submitted on behalf of the Arab Students' Committee of Tel Aviv University to Tel Aviv District Court challenging **discriminatory age restrictions** imposed on entry to Tel Aviv University's medical school, filed in 1/08 http://www.adalah.org/eng/pressreleases/pr.php?file=08_01_29_2

A Supreme Court petition filed in 3/08 challenging a law that **bans income support recipients from owning or using a car. Over 300,000 individuals** receive income support http://www.adalah.org/eng/pressreleases/pr.php?file=08_03_16_1

A Supreme Court petition demanding the inclusion of an Arab village in the list of communities eligible for **marketing quotas and subsidies for egg production**, filed in 4/08. In 2007, the Knesset allocated an additional NIS 8 million in subsidies for eggs. In 10/08, the AG stated it is inappropriate that no Arab farmers receive these quotas and subsidies and committed to provide new criteria to the court by mid-4/09 http://www.adalah.org/eng/pressreleases/pr.php?file=08_10_29

A Supreme Court petition filed in 7/08 demanding the amendment of the **pension insurance agreement** to extend its application to all workers over the age of 18 in order to prevent discrimination against Arab citizens http://www.adalah.org/eng/pressreleases/pr.php?file=08_08_06

A petition to the Haifa District Court filed in 9/08 challenging a **ban placed on the entry of driving instructors' cars into Carmiel on Saturdays and Jewish holidays** which has a disparate impact on Arab instructors causing them economic harm. Update: In 1/09, in a settlement with Adalah the municipality announced its decision to lift the ban, which was approved by the court http://www.adalah.org/eng/pressreleases/pr.php?file=09_1_04



Road sign outside Carmiel banning entry of driving instructors' cars on Saturdays and Jewish holidays

Prisoners' Rights

A Supreme Court petition filed together with the Prisoners' Rights and Rehabilitation Legal Clinic of Haifa University in 2/08 demanding **better transport conditions for prisoners** traveling between prisons and to courts. Approximately 1,800 prisoners are transported daily in IPS vehicles to various destinations in Israel http://www.adalah.org/eng/pressreleases/pr.php?file=08_02_22

A Supreme Court petition filed in 4/08 demanding an end to **discrimination against adult Arab prisoners** (40% of total prisoners in Israel) in education http://www.adalah.org/eng/pressreleases/pr.php?file=08_04_17

A petition submitted in 7/08 to the Nazareth District Court on behalf of prisoner Walid Daka, seeking **conjugal rights**, granted to Jewish Israeli prisoners such as Yigal Amir, who assassinated former Prime Minister Yitzhak Rabin in 1995 http://www.adalah.org/eng/pressreleases/pr.php?file=08_07_28

Adalah, together with ACRI and PCATI, filed a petition to the Supreme Court in 3/08 challenging an amendment to the **Criminal Procedure Law** that imposes harsh conditions of confinement on "security" detainees, mostly those from Gaza.

Around 9,000 Palestinian prisoners are classified as "security prisoners" and are being held in Israel http://www.adalah.org/eng/pressreleases/pr.php?file=08_03_06_1

Adalah, Al Mezan and Association for the Palestinian Prisoners petitioned the Supreme Court in 6/08 to demand that **Palestinians from Gaza**, completely banned since 2006, be permitted to visit their relatives in Israeli prisons. In 10/08, the state claimed that it has no obligation to allow family visits to around 1,000 Palestinians from Gaza incarcerated in Israel http://www.adalah.org/eng/pressreleases/pr.php?file=08_10_27

Occupied Palestinian Territory (OPT)

Adalah, together with Palestinian NGOs and mayors submitted an objection in 3/08 to the planning authorities against the **Eastern Ring Road Plan for Jerusalem**, which aims to cantonize Palestinian neighborhoods. The Ring Road is planned to stretch across approximately 1,200 dunams of mostly Palestinian-owned land. Advocacy is being undertaken with Al Quds University Human Rights Law Clinic and Harvard University Law School's Human Rights Law Clinic to stop the Ring Road (www.stoptheringroad.net) http://www.adalah.org/eng/pressreleases/pr.php?file=08_03_17

In 11/08, Adalah and the Civil Coalition for the Defense of Palestinians' Rights in Jerusalem (CCDPRJ) filed an objection to the National Council for Planning and Building on behalf of 56 Palestinian residents of East Jerusalem and 17 local NGOs against the **Jerusalem Regional Master Plan**, which will further entrench the settlements and alter the city's demographic composition http://www.adalah.org/eng/pressreleases/pr.php?file=08_11_27



Pictured: Adalah and CCDPRJ press conference for Jerusalem Regional Master Plan

Selected legal interventions

Land and Planning Rights

A letter sent in 6/08 to the AG demanding the freezing of **demolition orders** against Arab homes in the Triangle and Wadi Ara http://www.adalah.org/eng/pressreleases/pr.php?file=08_06_04

A letter sent in 7/08 to the Agriculture Ministry demanding that pastures be designated for **grazing camels** in the Naqab, and clear criteria to govern the registration of camels with the ministry be published. The Ministry rejected the demand http://www.adalah.org/eng/pressreleases/pr.php?file=08_07_23_1

In 9/08, Adalah represented Mr. Nouri Al-Uqbi on criminal charges that he was obstructing work of the Jewish National Fund (JNF). Adalah argued that the land in question did not belong to the JNF but to Mr. Al-Uqbi; Mr. Al-Uqbi admitted to obstructing the forestation work. The Beer el-Sabe Magistrate Court strongly criticized the JNF's conduct; it attempted to settle the legal dispute of Mr. Al-Uqbi's land through an improper criminal process, instead of through the civil courts. http://www.adalah.org/eng/pressreleases/pr.php?file=08_09_10_1

A letter sent in 12/08 to the Finance Minister and AG, demanding that they cancel the **confiscation of a plot of land** in the Jewish town of Yokneam and restore it to its original Arab owners living in Daliyat al-Carmel. The land was confiscated in 1965 and used to house a military base, which was recently removed http://www.adalah.org/eng/pressreleases/pr.php?file=08_12_04

Social, Economic and Education Rights

A letter sent to seven government ministries demanding **suitable employment for Arab women** within their offices in 3/08. Several ministries responded, stating they were trying to recruit women. Adalah is monitoring developments http://www.adalah.org/eng/pressreleases/pr.php?file=08_03_06

A letter to the employment office seeking an end to **discrimination against religious Arab women** in employment following reports of employers refusing to hire women wearing the Islamic veil, sent in 3/08 http://www.adalah.org/eng/pressreleases/pr.php?file=08_03_25

A letter sent to the National Insurance Institute (NII) demanding that it stop using **military and national service criterion** as condition for job appointments in 4/08. The NII responded in 5/08 that it would cancel this criterion

http://www.adalah.org/eng/features/N_%20NII_Military.pdf

A letter sent to the AG in 7/08 calling for the establishment of a **technological education center in Tamra** for 300 Arab students who have or are at risk of dropping out of school

http://www.adalah.org/eng/pressreleases/pr.php?file=08_08_04

A letter sent in 9/08 to the MOE and the Abu Basma Regional Council demanding a **school bus for preschool children** from the unrecognized village of Wadi Jaraba in the Naqab, who now have to wait two hours for a school bus, fully exposed to the sun. The issue was resolved and a bus has been provided

http://www.adalah.org/eng/pressreleases/pr.php?file=08_09_16

A pre-petition demanding that the government renew the license of a library in Nazareth to import **Arabic language books published in Syria and Lebanon** via Jordan and Egypt, as it has done for almost 30 years. *Update:* In 1/09, Adalah petitioned the Supreme Court

http://www.adalah.org/eng/pressreleases/pr.php?file=08_12_14

Civil and Political Rights

A position paper sent to MKs in 7/08 requesting that they vote against the Citizenship Bill (Amendment No. 9) 2008, which permits the **revocation of citizenship for disloyalty to the state**. This bill subsequently passed into law

<http://www.adalah.org/newsletter/eng/jul08/NU%20Orna%20Revoking%20Citizenship%2029.7.08.doc>

A letter sent to the Defense Minister in 8/08, demanding that he revoke his order to close down **the Al-Aqsa Association** and withdraw his proclamation of it as an illegal organization under the Defense (Emergency) Regulations. The order stands and the association remains closed

http://www.adalah.org/eng/pressreleases/pr.php?file=08_08_25

In 5/08, Adalah secured the release of **detained Arab demonstrators** before the Nazareth Magistrates' and District Courts who were arrested during the annual "March of Return" for the 60th anniversary of the Palestinian Nakba. Following these events, Adalah and the Arab Association for Human Rights (HRA) submitted comprehensive

complaints to the Justice Ministry's Police Investigations Department ("Mahash") in 9/08 documenting the **excessive force used by police** against the demonstrators at the march. Mahash is still investigating these events

http://www.adalah.org/eng/pressreleases/pr.php?file=08_09_25_1

Following a letter sent by Adalah, the AG in 10/08 refused to disqualify the Mayor of Ramle Yoel Lavi from running for re-election due to his **racist statements against Arab citizens**

http://www.adalah.org/eng/pressreleases/pr.php?file=08_10_24

In 12/08, Adalah represented tens of detainees arrested inside Israel for taking part in **demonstrations against the Israeli attacks on Gaza**. Adalah's representation led to the release of some detainees and the dropping of charges against them

http://www.adalah.org/eng/pressreleases/pr.php?file=08_12_30

An urgent letter sent in 12/08 to the AG demanding that the General Security Services (or "Shabak") stop summoning Arab leaders of political parties and movements to **GSS investigation** following their participation in demonstrations of solidarity with Gaza

http://www.adalah.org/eng/pressreleases/pr.php?file=09_1_2_1

Prisoners' Rights

A letter sent to the Justice Minister and AG in 4/08 asking them to object to a bill absolving the GSS and police from audio and video **recording of investigations with "security" detainees**. In 12/08 the Justice Minister responded. He claimed that the practice is legal based on a recently amended law.

http://www.adalah.org/eng/pressreleases/pr.php?file=08_05_07

A pre-petition submitted to the Israel Prison Service and AG in 11/08 demanding that the IPS end **discrimination against Palestinian political prisoners** in the provision of social and cultural services

http://www.adalah.org/eng/pressreleases/pr.php?file=08_11_30_1

A pre-petition submitted to the AG and IPS in 12/08 demanding that the Palestinian detainees and prisoners from Gaza be allowed to use telephones to check on their families following the continuous Israeli military attacks on Gaza

http://www.adalah.org/eng/pressreleases/pr.php?file=08_12_31

Occupied Palestinian Territory (OPT)

A pre-petition sent to the AG in 1/08 arguing that the **application of the Absentee Property Law** in East Jerusalem is illegal and demanding that no property belonging to Palestinians be confiscated under the law. In 2/08, the AG responded. He stated that the land at issue had been confiscated for public use and that the Absentee Property Law had not been applied.

<http://www.adalah.org/features/Absentee/Adalah%20Letter%20to%20Mazuz%20Absentee%20Property%20Jerusalem%20-%20english.doc>

A position paper issued jointly with HaMoked and ACRI in 6/08 arguing that a proposed law **precluding tort suits against the state** for damages inflicted by the army will legitimize further military attacks on Palestinians

http://www.adalah.org/eng/pressreleases/pr.php?file=08_06_12

A letter sent in 7/08 to the Prime Minister, Defense Minister and AG demanding the cancellation of an order issued by the Defense Minister to **demolish the homes of two families** whose relatives were implicated in fatal attacks on civilians in Jerusalem

http://www.adalah.org/eng/pressreleases/pr.php?file=08_07_10

A letter sent in 12/08 to the Defense Minister and AG demanding that **international aid and development workers be allowed to enter Gaza** and that clear regulations for entering Gaza be provided for humanitarian assistance and the protection of the rights of Palestinian civilians

http://www.adalah.org/eng/pressreleases/pr.php?file=08_12_05

An urgent letter to the Interior Minister and AG sent in 12/08 demanding that they lift the ban imposed on **Professor Richard Falk**, UN Special Rapporteur on the situation of human rights in the Palestinian Territories, from entering these areas.

http://www.adalah.org/eng/pressreleases/pr.php?file=08_12_15

Note: This report does not discuss Israel's military attack on the Gaza Strip, which took place between 27/12/08 and 19/01/09. Adalah's legal actions concerning these events will be covered in our 2009 activity reports.

Negative decisions delivered

In 1/08 the Supreme Court rejected a petition filed by Adalah and Gisha on behalf of ten Israeli and Palestinian NGOs against **Israel's fuel and electricity cuts to Gaza**, contrary to principles of international law

http://www.adalah.org/eng/pressreleases/pr.php?file=08_01_31

The Attorney General decided in 1/08 that no police officers or commanders involved in the fatal shootings of 13 Palestinian citizens in **October 2000** will face criminal indictment

http://www.adalah.org/eng/pressreleases/pr.php?file=08_01_29

In 2/08 the Supreme Court dismissed Adalah's petition demanding the cancellation of a police decision to prohibit commemoration ceremonies in Nazareth for deceased **PFLP leader George Habash**

http://www.adalah.org/eng/pressreleases/pr.php?file=08_02_29

In 6/08 the Supreme Court refused to order the Israeli army to provide a military report to family of **Mr. Meteb al-Nebari**, an Arab Bedouin citizen, killed by the army in suspicious circumstances

http://www.adalah.org/eng/pressreleases/pr.php?file=08_06_29

In 6/08, the Absorption of Discharged Soldiers Law was amended to allow the use of the **military service criterion** to determine eligibility for student housing at universities. The amendment overturned a district court decision accepting Adalah's petition to cancel Haifa University's use of this criterion. Adalah's Supreme Court petition concerning this issue was subsequently mooted

http://www.adalah.org/eng/pressreleases/pr.php?file=07_05_29-1

Major follow-up work

The Supreme Court in an interim ruling in 9/08 instructed that PLC members whose **Jerusalem residency status** was revoked must be allowed to submit applications to reinstate their status. Adalah and ACRI submitted an amicus brief in this case

http://www.adalah.org/eng/pressreleases/pr.php?file=08_09_17

In 11/08, an expanded seven justice panel of the Supreme Court decided to grant the state an additional one year to implement the **National Priority Areas** decision, a landmark ruling delivered by the court in 2/06. The court issued this decision following Adalah's motion for contempt of court and the state's response that it could not

implement the decision in less than five years due to budget constraints. *Update:* In 2/09, the Supreme Court rejected Adalah's motion for legal expenses spanning eight years of litigation http://www.adalah.org/eng/pressreleases/pr.php?file=0811_24

At a hearing in 4/08, seven years after Adalah's petition, the Supreme Court ordered the state to appoint members to a new committee formed to decide on criteria for allocating **budget balancing grants** to local authorities http://www.adalah.org/eng/pressreleases/pr.php?file=0804_13_1

The Supreme Court ordered the state to explain why the **Citizenship Law** banning family unification should not be struck down in 5/08, following a petition filed by Adalah. In 2007, the scope of the law was expanded to exclude not only Palestinian spouses from the OPT but also Arab and/or Muslim spouses from Syria, Lebanon, Iran and Iraq, defined in the law as "enemy states" http://www.adalah.org/eng/pressreleases/pr.php?file=0805_06

In 11/08, Adalah submitted concluding arguments to the Beer el-Sabe Magistrates' Court against **evacuation orders** issued by the state against all 1,000 residents of the unrecognized Arab Bedouin village of Atir-Umm el-Hieran in the Naqab http://www.adalah.org/eng/pressreleases/pr.php?file=0811_13

Legal Challenges

- *Decreasing judicial activism by the Supreme Court*

2008 marked the second year of Justice Dorit Beinisch's tenure as the new Israeli Supreme Court Chief Justice. Since the beginning of her tenure, the court has been subjected to a serious attack from the government and in particular Justice Minister Daniel Friedmann, a strong critic of what he views as the court's usurpation of the powers of the legislature. In parallel, Israeli society has shifted further to the right. The Supreme Court has therefore become more cautious in issuing rulings that may further undermine its position in the eyes of the Jewish Israeli majority. The Supreme Court has also appeared to be less inclined to deliver rulings overall, and to act in favor of Adalah's cases, and is postponing hearings on our cases more often than ever before with the result that many of our cases remain pending for long periods of time. The court did, however, hand down some positive interim decisions.

Adalah employed various techniques and strategies to manage this risk in the first half of 2008, including: entering into more negotiations with certain ministries/municipalities to resolve cases out of court after filing petitions; trying to file more cases to the lower courts, jurisdictional issues allowing; and employing institutional arguments relating to separation of powers and balance of power issues and the court's authority before the Supreme Court. Some adaptations to our litigation agenda are also being discussed.

- *New Anti-Arab Legislation*

In 2008, the Knesset considered many new pieces of "anti-Arab" legislation, several of which have been enacted into law. Some of these new laws and bills are ostensibly neutral, while others explicitly discriminate against Palestinians, including both citizens of the state and Palestinians in the OPT. Some new legislation is specifically designed to circumvent prior judicial rulings. Many of these new laws focus on issues conceived of as security-related such as citizenship and loyalty to the state; visits to "enemy states" resulting in the disqualification of those individuals from running for Knesset office; family unification; and criminal procedure laws for those suspected of security offenses, among others, all of which will have a disparate impact on Palestinians.

Discrimination against Palestinian citizens has existed in legislation that preceded the Basic Law on Human Dignity and Liberty – 1992, and was part and parcel of state policies. The new trend, however, is to enact legislation designed to anchor this discrimination in laws. In the OPT, the Knesset seeks to anchor in law the occupation's apartheid-like practices, most of which have previously been determined by military decrees.

In 2008, Adalah pursued several advocacy tracks to challenge these new laws and bills. Adalah has published position papers to MKs and government officials, often jointly with other Israeli and Palestinian NGOs, urging them to vote against this new legislation. We concurrently began to prepare petitions challenging these new laws for submission to the courts, and issued press releases and gave media interviews articulating our position. In addition, we discussed these new laws and bills in our international advocacy reports. Adalah has taken a multi-tiered approach to challenging the new anti-Arab legislation and is not relying on a single track.

Legal Education

Highlights



Adalah's 3rd annual law students' conference

- Adalah's work was **featured regularly in the media** including websites, print, radio and TV, in Hebrew, Arabic and English. International media coverage included Al Jazeera TV (Arabic and English), Al Arabiyya, the New York Times, the Washington Post, and The Economist
- Adalah updated its **tri-lingual website** several times a week. In 4/08, over 32,000 unique visitors entered our website, the highest monthly average
- Adalah published **12 volumes of its tri-lingual, monthly electronic newsletter**, highlighting legal news, plus articles and commentaries on the 60th anniversary of the Nakba, the siege on Gaza, prisoners' rights, new anti-Arab legislation, education rights, racism against the Arab minority, land rights and the Arab Bedouin
- Adalah made **3 videos** and posted them in our e-newsletters, YouTube, Facebook, etc.: two videos from our law students' conference; and one entitled "Forbidden Land" on Adalah's work on land restitution cases
- Adalah successfully held its **3rd annual law students' conference**, "Law in Action," held over three days and attended by 90 Arab students; trained two stagaires and provided legal apprenticeships to two more law students, one an Arab Bedouin citizen
- By invitation, Adalah's lawyers gave **32 lectures** at universities and law schools, at Israel Bar Association meetings and conferences, and at NGO events.

Figures

	Planned 2008	Achieved 2008
Seminars & conferences	3-4 public events	3 rd annual law students' conference
	30+ lectures	32 lectures
Publications & reports	12 vols. of Newsletter and subscribers up	Published 12 vols. of Newsletter
	Website	Reached a high of 32,400 unique visitors in 4/08; 2008 average of 19,050 unique monthly visitors
	Adalah's Review and Makan	AR to graphic design in 6/08, publication in early 2009; Makan in 2009
	The Reader	Reconsidering publication due to high costs
	Videos	Produced 3 videos
Media Outreach	Issue 50+ press releases & interviews	Issued 117 PRs; 15 cases were widely covered
	Newspaper op-eds	Published 3 articles
	Protest ads	3 ads about October 2000 and Gaza
Training for law students	Host 1-2 stagaires	Hosted 2 stagaires
	Work with law school clinic externs	Partnered with al-Quds HR Clinic, and NYU law school
	Seek and host LLM fellows	Hosted NIF and OSI-CEU LLM fellows and Harvard University BA

Seminars & conferences

Adalah's Annual Law Students' Conference. In 10/08, Adalah held its 3rd Annual Law Students' Conference. The conference, which was attended by 80 Arab law students from universities and colleges in Israel and Al Quds University, took place at Neve Shalom-Wahat al-Salaam over three days. The conference's theme was "Law in Action

in Field of Human Rights". The main subjects discussed were the Separation Wall, the October 2000 killings and the housing crisis for Palestinian citizens of Israel in the mixed cities. The students participated in a tour of the Wall in the Jerusalem area, and in panel discussions. They also participated in small group legal workshops on religious rights, prisoners' rights, the unrecognized Arab Bedouin villages, human rights under occupation and the rights of people with special needs and disabilities.



Pictured: Workshop on rights of people with special needs lead by Attorney Abbas Abbas (Al-Manarah) and Mr. Mohammed Diab



Pictured: Attorney Shlomo Cohen, former President of the Israel Bar Association, speaking to the students

A Human Rights Fair held during the conference allowed students to learn about the work of other Palestinian and Israeli human rights organizations. Adalah also presented a photo exhibit on the legal developments of the October 2000 case, which were then analyzed in a panel discussion. On the final day, law school legal clinic advisors and students who participated in legal clinics spoke about their experiences of representation and working with community organizations. External speakers included Dr. Shlomo Cohen, the former chair of the Israel Bar Association, Professor Ronen Shamir, Tel Aviv University, Attorney Munir Nusseibeh from Al Quds University, and Ronit Harmati-Elfren, Director of Legal Clinics at Haifa University.

For more information, see:

<http://www.adalah.org/newsletter/eng/oct08/7.php>

To view the conference program, see:

<http://www.adalah.org/eng/features/Law%20Students%20Conference%20Program%202008.doc>

To view a video of the conference produced by Adalah, see:

<http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=onwfxL2d1PU>

External lectures

By request, Adalah lawyers gave around **32** lectures at university and law school symposia and conferences, Israel Bar Association meetings and conferences, and NGO events. Presentations included: the internationalization of cause-lawyering; family unification and citizenship; housing and land rights; the Democratic Constitution and constitution-making; commissions of inquiry; the Ring Road in Jerusalem; the Supreme Court and Gaza cases; and the Law of Return and the Right of Return. Adalah also participated in Land Day commemorations, protests against the siege on Gaza, and "Nakba at 60" events in Israel

Publications & reports

Adalah published **12 volumes of its monthly electronic newsletter** in Arabic, Hebrew and English. Themes of the newsletters included the 60th anniversary of the Nakba, the siege on Gaza, International Women's Day, prisoners' rights, October 2000, and Land Day. Multi-media items included photo slideshows, a roundtable discussion on whether or not to continue to petition the Supreme Court on OPT cases, a power-point presentation on the Nakba, and three videos. Please click on the following links to view the Newsletters published in 2008:

Jan. Vol. 44: October 2000 Killings and Gaza

<http://www.adalah.org/newsletter/eng/jan08/jan08.html?navi=%2Fnewsletter%2Feng%2Fjan08%2Fjan08.html>

Feb., Vol. 45: Supreme Court and OPT cases

<http://www.adalah.org/newsletter/eng/feb08/feb08.html?navi=%2Fnewsletter%2Feng%2Ffeb08%2Ffeb08.html>

March, Vol. 46: Land Day and Palestine

<http://www.adalah.org/newsletter/eng/mar08/mar08.html?navi=%2Fnewsletter%2Feng%2Fmar08%2Fmar08.html>

April, Vol. 47: Prisoners' Rights

<http://www.adalah.org/newsletter/eng/apr08/apr08.html?navi=%2Fnewsletter%2Feng%2Fapr08%2Fapr08.html>

May, Vol. 48: 60th Anniversary of the Nakba
<http://www.adalah.org/newsletter/eng/may08/may08.html?navi=%2Fnewsletter%2Feng%2Fmay08%2Fmay08.html>

June, Vol. 49: International Day against Torture
<http://www.adalah.org/newsletter/eng/jun08/jun08.html?navi=%2Fnewsletter%2Feng%2Fjun08%2Fjun08.html>

July, Vol. 50: New Anti-Arab Legislation
<http://www.adalah.org/newsletter/eng/jul08/jul08.html?navi=%2Fnewsletter%2Feng%2Fjul08%2Fjul08.html>

August, Vol. 51: Education Rights
<http://www.adalah.org/newsletter/eng/aug08/aug08.html?navi=%2Fnewsletter%2Feng%2Faug08%2Faug08.html>

Sept., Vol. 52: 8th Anniversary of October 2000
<http://www.adalah.org/newsletter/eng/sep08/sep08.html?navi=%2Fnewsletter%2Feng%2Fsep08%2Fsep08.html>

October, Vol. 53: Akka (Acre) and AG Mazuz
<http://www.adalah.org/newsletter/eng/oct08/oct08.html?navi=%2Fnewsletter%2Feng%2Foct08%2Foct08.html>

November, Vol. 54: Jerusalem
<http://www.adalah.org/newsletter/eng/nov08/nov08.html?navi=%2Fnewsletter%2Feng%2Fnov08%2Fnov08.html>

Dec., Vol. 55: Land Rights and Arab Bedouin
<http://www.adalah.org/newsletter/eng/dec08/dec08.html>

Newsletter Subscribers: The average number of monthly **subscribers** to the newsletter numbered around 15,000 in 2008. This represents a decrease from the last reported numbers in 2007 as the email lists were cleaned up in 2008. However, it should be stressed that thousands of non-subscribed readers view the Newsletter each month; e.g. recent statistics from the website of Arabs48, where the Newsletter is posted monthly, show that around 10,000 people open each Newsletter from that website. Further, articles and commentaries posted in the Newsletter are regularly republished on the websites of a host of media outlets and HR NGOs

Newsletter survey: In 9/08, Adalah sent out a questionnaire with the Newsletter in Arabic, Hebrew and English seeking feedback from our readers. Many of the responses praised the Newsletter, for its professionalism. Among the recommendations received were:

- Continue to publish academic articles
- Include more multi-media items
- Increase awareness of Adalah's Review in the wider Arab world

To view the survey, see:
<http://www.adalah.org/newsletter/eng/sep08/sep08.html?navi=%2Fnewsletter%2Feng%2Fsep08%2Fsep08.html>

Website: Adalah frequently updated its tri-lingual websites with new press releases and primary documentation concerning our legal work and international advocacy, and photo galleries. **In 2008, the highest ever number of average monthly users visited our website.**

Videos: In 12/08, Adalah released a short documentary film entitled "**Forbidden Land**", in which Adalah joined Palestinian Arab families from Lajoun and Nazareth in their fight to regain land confiscated by Israel in the 1950s. Adalah is representing the people of Lajoun in an appeal filed to the Supreme Court against the confiscation of land belonging to 300 Arab families. Through the video, Adalah hopes to raise awareness of the case of Lajoun and internally displaced Palestinians in Israel in general. To watch "Forbidden Land", visit:
http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=M_6ujxFmOU



Pictured: Mohammed Abd El Hassan Jabareen, former resident of Lajoun in a scene from "Forbidden Land"

Adalah also produced two short in-house videos during the year. The first documented Adalah's Annual Law Students' Conference held in 10/08 and featured interviews with the participants on their expectations and experiences during the conference, and documented some of the main activities. To watch the video, visit:
<http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=onwfxL2d1PU>

In 11/08, Adalah released its second in-house video which gave the floor to Arab law students to speak out about the experience of studying law at Israeli universities and colleges. To watch the video, visit:
<http://www.adalah.org/newsletter/eng/nov08/students.php>

Adalah's Review, Vol. 5, "On Criminalization": The volume is with the graphic designer and publication of 1,500 copies of the printed editions in Arabic, Hebrew and English is expected in March 2009

Makan, Vol. 2, "Narratives, Space and the Rights of Indigenous and Minority Groups": 1,500 copies Arabic, Hebrew and English printed editions will be published in 2009

Media outreach

In 2008, Adalah published and tracked coverage of **117 press releases** on our work in Arabic, Hebrew and English.

<http://www.adalah.org/eng/pressreleases2008.php>

Around 15 of Adalah's cases attracted widespread media attention in 2008. Cases that received the most coverage included:

- The petition filed by Adalah and Gisha on behalf of 10 Palestinian and Israeli HR organizations against Israel's **fuel and electricity cuts to Gaza** received extremely widespread coverage in the local and international media, surpassing news coverage of all other legal representations
- The AG's decision not to criminally indict police involved in the **October 2000 killings** was widely covered in the local media and received some international coverage. Adalah held a press conference with the Arab High Follow-up Committee and the Committee of the Victims' Families in Jerusalem immediately after the AG's decision, attended by all Israeli media outlets. Adalah obtained in-depth coverage of the decision, including an interview with GD Hassan Jabareen, and the resulting demonstration by over 20,000 people on Al Jazeera TV (English)
- The international media focused on covering items related to "**Israel at 60**" during the first half of the year. Adalah received related coverage in this context on the front page of the New York Times (land cases) and in The Economist (the Democratic Constitution)
- The objection filed by Adalah against the **Jerusalem Regional Master Plan** in 11/08 received widespread local and international media coverage. In 11/08 Adalah and the Civic Coalition in Jerusalem held a press conference attended by dozens of journalists from media outlets that reported on the case, including Arabic satellite

channels Al-Jazeera, MBC and Abu Dhabi, and newspapers, including al-Quds al-Arabi, Al-Hayat and al-Ayam.

- The Israeli Hebrew media widely picked up on the Supreme Court's decision in the **National Priority Areas case** in 11/08, e.g. Haaretz published a front-page article analyzing the decision and the relationship between the court; Hebrew-language radio stations Reshet Bet and Galey Tsahal also broadcast major reports
- A hearing held in 11/08 on the **ban of family visits to Palestinian prisoners from Gaza** received extensive media coverage in the Palestinian and Arabic-language media, including special reports on the Al-Jazeera satellite channel and Radio Palestine.
- The **denial of entry into Israel of Prof. Richard Falk**, UN Special Rapporteur for Human Rights in the OPT in 12/08, and Adalah's letter to the state authorities against this move was widely covered in the local and international media. The BBC, Reuters, American Chronicle were among the outlets that covered the issue and cited Adalah's involvement

Additional media: By the invitation of Human Rights Watch, Adalah's staff participated in a press conference for international journalists in Jerusalem in 3/08 to launch its report "Off the Map" on land and planning rights in the unrecognized villages in the Naqab. Adalah contributed substantial research to the report: <http://www.hrw.org/reports/2008/iopt0308/>. Adalah distributed a DVD of its documentary film on the unrecognized villages at the event.

Adalah Attorney Abeer Baker wrote a lengthy article for Arabic-language newspaper *al-Einwan al-Raisi* on the crime of "meeting with a foreign agent" and the way it is used against Arab citizens in 1/08. Attorney Baker also wrote two opinion pieces published in *Ynet* (Hebrew) and the Arabs48 news website in 6/08, focusing on the AG's discriminatory policies in filing October 2000-related indictments.

Protest Advertisements

In 2/08, Adalah placed a protest ad with the Arab High Follow-Up Committee and the Committee of the Victims' Families (October 2000) in *Haaretz* soon after the AG's decision, entitled "Killing Arab Citizens – Approved". The ad was also posted on Adalah's website and Newsletter.

<http://www.adalah.org/eng/features/october/mazuzenglis h.pdf>



In 9/08, in the lead up to the 8th Anniversary of the October 2000 killings, Adalah produced 1,000 copies of a protest ad in the form of a postcard, which were distributed to the local public in Arabic <http://www.adalah.org/newsletter/eng/sep08/sep08.html?navi=%2Fnewsletter%2Feng%2Fsep08%2Fsep08.html>

A prominent advert was placed in *Ha'aretz* (Hebrew) on 29.12.08 with the slogan, "Civilians are not Cannon Fodder. Not in Gaza. Not in Sderot" and featuring the latest statistics on the number of people killed and injured in Gaza and in Israel. The ad was signed by: ACRI, Adalah, B'Tselem, PHR, Gisha, Bimkom, Rabbis for Human Rights, Amnesty International - Israel Section, Yesh Din, and PCATI.

Training for law students & recent law graduates

Mr. Ihab Asleh and Mr. Alla Abdallah completed their one-year legal apprenticeship training with Adalah in 3/08, and the official traineeship of Ms. Haneen Naamnih began in 4/08. In 6/08, Adalah also hired an Arab Bedouin trainee lawyer from the Naqab, Mr. Salem Abu Medeghem, Adalah's former Naqab field researcher. Adalah also provided weekly media training to Ms. Marwa 'Abed, an undergraduate media and communications student from Haifa University.

Adalah staff contributed to the Al Quds University's Human Rights Clinic by giving lectures to the students on Israeli law and Supreme Court jurisprudence, participating in conferences and undertaking joint advocacy projects on the Eastern Ring Road case.



Pictured: Al Quds University law students, Harvard Law School students and Adalah attorneys meeting on the Eastern Ring Road case at Adalah

Legal Education Challenges

- The Hebrew media is hostile to Arab citizens, and much of Adalah's legal work was portrayed negatively and as political in 2008. It has become much harder to receive coverage in *Haaretz*, as it has substantially cut back on its legal reporting, shifted to the right and increased coverage of economic news. Adalah has begun to frame its press releases on cases from more of an economic perspective where possible in order to gain more coverage in *The Marker*, the daily business supplement of *Haaretz*. Adalah is also developing strategies to attract more positive coverage in Hebrew-language media outlets.
- Coverage of Adalah's work in the international Arabic and English media, as well as the Palestinian media (OPT) is limited but steadily increasing, especially with our OPT work. Adalah needs to proactively solicit international coverage on a regular basis and be more creative and invest more resources in this area. This work involves the packaging of issues for feature stories rather than item-by-item "news". It must also make more personal contacts with international journalists to become a better-known source of information and must target them with feature stories that overlap with their specific agendas.
- Adalah did not hold the planned number of seminars/ conferences or hire a Publications Editor to complete our scheduled publications in 2008 due to the steep decline in the dollar / shekel exchange rate during the first nine months of the year. As explained in the Institutional Development section (see below), Adalah initiated across the board cuts and other cost-saving measures in response to the financial uncertainty. During the final three months of 2008, Adalah progressed further with its planned legal education activities.

International Advocacy

Highlights



Pictured: Representatives of the October 2000 victims' families meeting with victims' families who are working with the Khulamani support group in South Africa

A delegation headed by the Chairman of the Arab High Follow-up Committee including representatives of the October 2000 victims' families and Adalah traveled to **South Africa** in 4/08 to seek international support for the group's demand for **truth, justice and accountability for the October 2000 families**. The visit was the first of a series of international advocacy initiatives launched after the AG's decision in 1/08 not to indict any police responsible for the October 2000 killings. SA officials and human rights lawyers and activists offered strong support. The delegation learned about transitional justice mechanisms and processes of memorialization pursued in SA. The Foundation for Human Rights and the Legal Resources Centre (LRC) hosted the visit.

http://www.adalah.org/eng/pressreleases/pr.php?file=08_04_23

Arab MKs, political leaders, the Chairman of the Arab High Follow-up Committee and Adalah traveled to South Africa in 6/08 for a **study visit on constitution building**. The visit was organized with the LRC and the Human Sciences Research Council (HSRC). It included meetings with academics, human rights lawyers, ministers, MPs and ANC officials.

http://www.adalah.org/eng/pressreleases/pr.php?file=08_06_05

Twelve representatives from Arab political parties, academics and Adalah participated in a **two-week educational course** in 10/08 on the history of South Africa and the **struggle against apartheid** by the African National Congress (ANC) and other actors. This visit was supported by the HSRC and the SA government.

http://www.adalah.org/eng/pressreleases/pr.php?file=08_10_22

Adalah published "Reflections on South Africa" by five members of the delegation in *Adalah's Newsletter* in 11/08:

<http://www.adalah.org/newsletter/eng/nov08/Reflections%20on%20South%20Africa%20English%5B1%5D.pdf>

In 11/08, Adalah held a briefing for embassy representatives at the Heinrich Boll Foundation on legal developments in 2008, which was attended by **ambassadors and political officers from 23 countries**. Adalah urged participants to raise issues regarding racist anti-Arab laws and the lack of accountability for the October 2000 killings with their governments and with Israel. Throughout the year, Adalah met with embassy representatives, and hosted and briefed delegations of parliamentarians from SA, Belgium and the EU.

<http://www.adalah.org/newsletter/eng/nov08/6.php>

Adalah strongly protested the denial of entry and deportation from Israel of **Prof. Richard Falk, UN Special Rapporteur for HR in the OPT**, in a letter to the Interior Minister and the AG in 12/08. This letter received wide coverage in the local and international media.

http://www.adalah.org/eng/pressreleases/pr.php?file=08_12_15

Figures

	Planned 2008	Achieved 2008
Reports/interventions /advocacy to UN/EU	5-7	15
Briefings for embassies	2	1 & frequent meetings
Participate in international human rights conferences	7-10	14

United Nations Advocacy

Ms. Asma Jahangir, the **UN Special Rapporteur on Religious Freedom**, visited Adalah's offices in

1/08 for a briefing at which Arab religious leaders and Adalah called on her to urge Israel to cease discrimination against Arab religious communities. Adalah submitted a short issues paper to the SR. http://www.adalah.org/eng/pressreleases/pr.php?file=0801_24_3



Pictured from left: Adalah's General Director Attorney Hassan Jabareen; the President of the Shar'ia Court of Appeals in Israel, Qadi Ahmad Natour; the UN SR Asma Jahangir; the Chairman of the Al-Aqsa Organization, Mr. Farid Hajj; and the Archbishop of the Greek Orthodox Patriarchate in Jerusalem, Atallah Hanna

A joint NGO briefing paper (AI Haq, Adalah, PCHR-Gaza) submitted to the UN Human Rights Council in 2/08 analyzing the Supreme Court's decision to reject a petition challenging **fuel and electricity cuts to Gaza**. Adalah and Gisha represented Palestinian civilians and ten Palestinian and Israeli human rights NGOs in this case.

<http://www.adalah.org/newsletter/ara/feb08/English%20-%20AI-Haq%20-%20Joint.doc>

The UN Independent Expert (IE) on Minority Issues cited the Citizenship Law banning family unification between Palestinians as an example of the denial or deprivation of citizenship in her report to the UN Human Rights Council of 2/08. Attorney Hassan Jabareen participated in an UN expert consultation on non-citizen rights supported by the IE in Geneva in 12/07.

<http://www2.ohchr.org/english/bodies/hrcouncil/docs/7session/A-HRC-7-23.doc>

Prof. Philip Alston, the UN Special Rapporteur on extrajudicial, summary or arbitrary executions criticized the AG's decision in the **October 2000 killings cases** in his report of 5/08 to the UN HR Council. The SR concluded that the AG's decision not to issue indictments "would appear to fall short of international standards." Adalah provided

information to the SR about the October 2000 cases.

<http://www2.ohchr.org/english/bodies/hrcouncil/docs/8session/A-HRC-8-3.doc>

Adalah Attorney Fatmeh El-'Ajou testified before the **UN Special Committee** to Investigate Israeli Practices Affecting the Human Rights of the Palestinian People in 6/08 in Amman. She focused on a legal analysis of recent Israeli Supreme Court cases dealing with the status of Gaza. Participation supported by the UN.

The Committee's report and Israel's response:

<http://www.reliefweb.int/rw/RWB.NSF/db900SID/TUJA-7L64L9?OpenDocument>

The United Against Torture (UAT) coalition submitted an NGO report to the **UN Committee Against Torture (CAT)** in 9/08. Adalah Attorney Fatmeh El-'Ajou together with representatives from UAT and AI Haq traveled to Geneva in 11/08 to introduce the main concerns of the UAT to a CAT country rapporteur on Israel and international NGOs working to eradicate torture. The CAT will review Israel in 5/09. Adalah contributed 10 sections to the report, which analyze various Israeli laws and practices constituting torture and/or cruel, inhuman and degrading treatment of prisoners and Palestinian civilians in the OPT. Adalah also participated in diplomatic briefings in Israel on the UAT report. Participation supported by the EU.

[http://www.unitedagainsttorture.org/assets/uat%20alternative%20report%20-%20israel%20\(3\).doc](http://www.unitedagainsttorture.org/assets/uat%20alternative%20report%20-%20israel%20(3).doc)

The UN Human Rights Council's **Universal Periodic Review (UPR)** issued a report following its first review of Israel in 12/08. Among its 33 recommendations, the Council urged Israel to ensure the rights of the Arab Bedouin in the Naqab, suspend the ban on family unification, implement the Or Commission's recommendations into the October 2000 killings, and end the Occupation. Adalah submitted its NGO report to the Council in 7/08, and many of our key concerns were reflected in the Council's report. Adalah Attorney Suhad Bishara attended the UPR session in Geneva in 12/08, and presented at side-events and at a press conference organized together with Badil – Resource Center for Palestinian Residency and Refugee Rights.

<http://www.adalah.org/newsletter/eng/jul08/jul08.html?navi=%2Fnewsletter%2Feng%2Fjul08%2Fjul08.html>

UPR documentation on Israel available at:

<http://www.ohchr.org/EN/HRBodies/UPR/PAGES/ILSession3.aspx>

In 12/08, Adalah Attorney Sawsan Zaher participated as an expert in the UN's inaugural session of the **Forum on Minority Issues** in Geneva. Experts from around the world were invited to give comments on a draft recommendation on minorities and the right to education that may be adopted as an authoritative interpretation of international human rights law. Attorney Zaher provided interventions on budgets; access to education for girls; and curriculum development. Participation supported by the UN. Forum on Minority Issues documentation and Adalah's contribution available at: <http://www2.ohchr.org/english/bodies/hrcouncil/minority/forum.htm>

EU Advocacy

Adalah Attorney Fatmeh El-'Ajou in 4/08, and Adalah General Director Hassan Jabareen and Adalah Attorney Sawsan Zaher in 9/08, participated in a **series of advocacy meetings in Brussels** with European Commission, European Parliament and European Council representatives organized by the Euro-Mediterranean Human Rights Network (EMHRN) and the FIDH. The advocacy in 4/08 was held alongside a meeting of the **EMHRN's Working Group on Palestine/Israel**. Participation supported by EMHRN and FIDH.

The EMHRN and its members in Israel and the OPT, including Adalah, submitted a note expressing deep concern over the deterioration in the human rights situation in Israel and the OPT to the **EU-Israel Human Rights Working Group** in 4/08, and called on the EU to cooperate to bring an end to the highlighted human rights violations. <http://www.adalah.org/newsletter/ara/apr08/Note%20EU-Israel%20HR%20WG%20April%20-final.doc>

The EMHRN submitted a briefing paper to the **EU-Israel Association Council** ahead of the Council's annual meeting in 6/08 urging the EU to raise grave concerns over the human rights of Palestinians in the OPT and in Israel, and to bring diplomatic pressure to bear on Israel to alleviate them. <http://www.adalah.org/eng/features/Note%20Israel%20%20in%20view%20of%20the%20EU%20Israel%20Association%20Council%20-%20June%202008.pdf>

Adalah's International Advocacy Director Rina Jabareen participated in an **EU Advocacy workshop** in Brussels organized by Christian Aid (CA) for its NGO partners from Israel and the OPT in 11/08. Meetings were also held with the European Commission, the Council, the Parliament

and the permanent representation offices of EU member states and NGO coalition platforms with a strong EU lobby presence in Brussels such as APRODEV, CIDSE and Crisis Action. She also attended a meeting of the **EMHRN's Working Group on Palestine/Israel**. Participation supported by CA and EMHRN.

Adalah contributed to two important documents submitted in 12/08 by the EMHRN to the EU concerning the **EU-Israel Action Plan**. The first critiqued Israel's lack of progress in improving its HR record in 2008; the EU requested NGO-input into its annual progress report on action plans with ENP countries. The second offered a series of specific recommendations to include HR in the new EU-Israel Action Plan to be adopted in 4/09. <http://www.adalah.org/newsletter/eng/dec08/dec08.html>

International HR Organizations Conferences and Networks

Attorney Hassan Jabareen, Adalah's International Advocacy Director Rina Jabareen and Adalah Attorney Fatmeh El-'Ajou participated in a series of workshops to reassess **Israel's practices in the OPT under international law**. The workshops were convened in South Africa in 2/08 and 11/08 by the HSRC and brought together an international team of lawyers and legal scholars to discuss recent findings on HR violations in the OPT made by the former UN SR for the OPT, Prof. John Dugard. Adalah contributed extensive materials for a book to be issued by the project. Participation supported by the HSRC.

Adalah Attorney Sawsan Zaher participated in two meetings of the **EMHRN's Working Group on Gender**: one in Cairo in 5/08, which was also a regional coordination and planning meeting on the Istanbul Action Plan; and one in Brussels in 10/08, which also included lobbying activities and a public event. Attorney Zaher is the convenor of the WG. She also participated in the **EMHRN's Executive Committee** meeting in Brussels in 10/08 and the **EMHRN's General Assembly Meeting** in Barcelona in 12/08. Participation was supported by the EMHRN.

Adalah Attorney Suhad Bishara gave a presentation on the Nakba at a conference on "Breaking the Logic of Displacement" organized by the **Forum for Human Rights in Israel/Palestine** to commemorate 60 Years of the Nakba in 4/08 in Bern, Switzerland. The forum comprises Swiss

organizations active in ME development and HR. Participation supported by the Forum.

Adalah's General Director Attorney Hassan Jabareen and the Deputy State Attorney (DSA) Shai Nitzan participated in a special panel in London organized by the **Human Rights Lawyers Association (HRLA)** in 5/08. The event, entitled "Human Rights during 60 Years of the Israeli-Palestinian Conflict," was attended by around 250 people. Attorney Jabareen spoke about Palestinians under Israeli law since 1948; DSA Nitzan spoke about Israeli Supreme Court judgments and Arab citizens of Israel. Attorney Jabareen also spoke at Cambridge University before a group of 25 faculty members and ME specialists in the Department of Middle East History. Participation supported by the HRLA.

Adalah Attorney Suhad Bishara undertook a four-day **speaking tour in France and Belgium** in 6/08 on Adalah's Democratic Constitution. The tour was organized by the French Jewish Union for Peace in the framework of the International Campaign celebrating 60 Years of Israel and the 60th anniversary of the Nakba. Participation supported by the Forum.

Adalah's International Advocacy Director Rina Jabareen participated in OxfamNovib (ON)-led and supported **key indicators workshops** in The Hague in 7/08 and 10/08. ON is developing indicators to try to determine long-term change in people's lives due to activities of NGO partners. Adalah tested selected key indicators on a small group of Arab Bedouin women in the Naqab who are beneficiaries of Adalah's legal actions and reported back on the field experience. Ten ON partners from Asia, Africa, South America and the Middle East participated in this work group.

Adalah's legal apprentice, Haneen Naamnih, was selected and attended the EMHRN's one-week **Human Rights Education Summer School** in Istanbul, Turkey in 7/08. The theme of the summer school was protecting human rights in conflict. She was also selected to participate in the **EMHRN's General Assembly** meeting in Barcelona in 12/08. Participation supported by EMHRN. Read more: <http://www.euromedrights.net/pages/526/page/language/1>

Attorney Hassan Jabareen gave a presentation on the **failure of domestic remedies in cases of killings of Palestinians** at a conference convened by Diakonia entitled "Palestine/Israel: Making Monitoring Work – Re-Enforcing International Law in Europe." The two-day conference was held at

the Free University in Brussels in 9/08 and brought together leading lawyers and human rights activists from Israel/OPT and Europe. Participation supported by Diakonia.

International Advocacy Challenges

- *Limited resources restrict wider intervention*
To date, Adalah has allocated limited staff and financial resources for international advocacy despite the extensive expansion of this work at the UN and EU levels and the need to invest more in this regard, especially with the increasing nationalist tendencies in Israeli society and the courts. The minimal resources devoted to international advocacy has also narrowed Adalah's ability to follow-up on this work at the local level.

In 2008, Adalah sought to increase staffing for its international advocacy by recruiting overseas fellows from universities and other sources abroad. Adalah recruited a Harvard University student to intern with the organization for one year on scholarship since 9/08, which has greatly assisted the department in its international advocacy and international media outreach. However, Adalah needs to carefully consider whether it wishes to utilize its potential and ability to seek to expand in this area of activity, particularly concerning US advocacy and local follow-up work such as the implementation of favorable concluding observations and statements; more systematic information-sharing and calls on foreign embassies in Israel; and the translation and dissemination of materials to the Palestinian community in Israel.

- *Assessing impact is not clear-cut*
Assessing the impact of Adalah's international advocacy work on Israeli policies and practices is a difficult task. In general, a direct cause-effect relationship between Adalah's specific initiatives internationally and the impact at the societal and/or policy level cannot be drawn, especially as numerous actors are often involved. In the short-term, the Israeli courts appear to be somewhat more careful or sensitive when strong concerns are voiced by the international community (infrequently) regarding institutionalized discrimination against Palestinian citizens in Israel or gross human rights violations against Palestinians in the OPT, while the government of Israel seems to be unperturbed by international critique, especially as no sanctions have been imposed or are forthcoming. Nonetheless, Adalah continues to report on discrimination and gross human rights violations to the international community, to use favorable concluding observations and statements in our legal representations before the Israeli courts, and to create a historical record.

Institutional Development

Highlight – A new office for Adalah



Adalah is delighted to announce that it moved into its new office in 5/08. Purchasing an office had been a long-term organizational goal. The new office substantially increases Adalah's accessibility and visibility, as the building is located across the street from the "Haifa Mercaz" train station at the bottom of Ben Gurion Street, a major thoroughfare. Adalah joins a community of Palestinian and Israeli NGOs, the Bar Association, and the Haifa University Law School in the city. The office consists of one floor of a three-storey building dating from 1935. It is 220m² and has 12 rooms. Renovations were done in 2008 prior to our relocation. The opening party was held in 7/08.



High Praise for Adalah's Work

In 9/08 by request of the European Commission, Adalah facilitated a one-week monitoring evaluation of our current EU project, "Promoting Access to the Israeli Legal System for Arab Citizens of Israel," 2006-2008. Key recommendations offered by the monitor have been and will be further integrated by Adalah into our programs. The monitor had high praise for Adalah's work noting that:

- "The project shows outstanding added value and pertinence from every angle of analysis"
- "Implementation is highly efficient, well monitored and very professional"
- Regarding effectiveness: "Progress towards the project purpose is remarkable"
- "Impact to date and impact prospects are very high" and the service offered by Adalah is "not provided by any other institution"

Fundraising

• *New projects and proposals*

A new three-year EUR 800,000 project to be undertaken by Adalah, Physicians for Human Rights-Israel and Al Mezan in Gaza to combat and prevent torture and ill-treatment of Palestinian prisoners in Israeli jails and civilians in the OPT was awarded a grant by the EU in 1/09. This project marks the first time that the organizations have sought funds together for our cooperative work. Adalah will manage the project before the EU on behalf of the three organizations in 2009-2011.

The Welfare Association awarded Adalah US \$15,000 for a research study to be undertaken in 2009 on the implementation of land and planning laws in East Jerusalem.

A full proposal was submitted by Adva Center and Adalah to the EU for a two-year EUR 240,000 project involving research, budget analysis and socio-economic litigation on behalf of Arab children and youth at risk. The project was not selected for funding however the EU informed us that it received excellent scores. Adalah and ADVA will re-submit in 2009.

A concept note drafted by Adalah and Sikkuy for a two-year EUR 250,000 project focusing on the implementation of positive Israeli Supreme Court judgments was not pre-selected by the EU for possible funding. The proposal missed the pre-selection grade by one point.

A proposal for capacity-building entitled "Legal Empowerment to Promote the Indigenous Rights of the Arab Bedouin" was submitted to the International Fund for Agricultural Development (IFAD) for US \$30,000. The project was declined support.

- *Narrative and financial reports*

Adalah's Annual Report of Activities and Audited Financial Report for 2007 were completed and sent to all donors. These reports were accepted and found to be of high quality. Adalah's half-year report of activities, and unaudited financial report January to June 2008 were completed and sent to donors. A new reader-friendly format was introduced in these reports and Adalah received positive feedback from donors.

- *International Donors to Adalah in 2008*

We sincerely appreciate the generous contributions of our international donors to Adalah's work: The Ford Foundation; OxfamNovib; The Open Society Development Fund; the European Commission; The New Israel Fund; The Naomi and Nehemiah Cohen Foundation; The Federal Department of Foreign Affairs – Switzerland; EED; Christian Aid; The Welfare Association; The Foundation for Middle East Peace.

Financial challenges & strengths

The **steep decline in the dollar/shekel exchange rate** increased actual expenses by around 20% during the first nine months of 2008. Adalah prepared a revised budget for 2008 and instigated cuts and cost-saving measures to manage this challenge: staff members took 1-2 weeks unpaid leave and two staff members were laid off from their positions; Adalah trimmed reimbursements for staff transportation costs; Adalah closed its office in Jaffa-Tel Aviv in 4/08; Adalah deferred some activities and expenses as much as possible to the end of the year in order to best assess needed costs; and Board-staff strategy meetings during the first half of the year were held in our offices instead of other locations. The dollar/shekel rate recovered substantially in the fall of 2008, which allowed Adalah to go forward with most its activities.

There is **very stiff competition for funds** among NGOs. Obtaining EU funding was highly competitive: even with new partnerships with Israeli and Palestinian NGOs, innovative projects and smaller budgets, it was very difficult to secure funds for 2009 and beyond. Other donors have

announced possible cuts in funds in 2009 due to changing policies and priorities. During the second half of 2008, attempts to expand our pool of European and US donors were intensified, and funding from other sources such as income-generating activities, local fundraising and in-kind donations were also pursued.

Adalah **secured around 80% of its budget for 2009** as of 12/08. To date the global financial crisis has not affected our fundraising for 2009. However, Adalah is mindful of the challenges ahead for 2010 and 2011. Adalah has reserve funds and some income-generating capacity to meet the short-term needs of the organization should it be required to supplement its income to a limited extent, and provided that the dollar/shekel and dollar/EUR exchange rates remain favorable.

General Assembly

In 10/08, Adalah held its annual General Assembly (GA) meeting at its new offices in Haifa. The meeting was well-attended by GA members, including several new members and the Board of Directors and Adalah's staff. The GA considered reports prepared by Adalah on its activities in 2006, 2007 and 2008. The main presentation concerned Adalah's activities and achievements in 2007. Financial reports were presented by our auditor Nazeeh Bocaie, CPA and reviewed by the GA and future financial plans introduced, particularly focused on initiatives to develop greater self-reliance. The Control Committee provided its reports on Adalah's activities and institutional and financial practices.

The GA approved the new incoming board members: Dr. Khalid Abu Asbeh and Dr. Masoud Hamdan. They also reviewed the new criteria for selecting new members to Adalah's Board of Directors. According to this new method, the Board will recommend new members to the GA when terms expire and vacancies become available. These members should then be approved by the GA before their appointment as members of the Board. There are currently 65 dues paying members of Adalah's GA. The GA members also selected Advocate Jeries Rawashdeh as a new member of Adalah's Control Committee.

<http://www.adalah.org/newsletter/eng/oct08/8.php>

Implementation of the External Evaluation

Pursuant to recommendations made by the external evaluators in 7/07, Adalah worked with an organizational consultant, Ms. Iman Kandalaf, in 2008 on re-organizing our structure and systems. Adalah has placed strong emphasis on trying to implement the organizational, administrative, and financial aspects of the evaluation report. Particular attention was paid to defining and drafting individual job descriptions, including the roles and responsibilities and the functions of the four departments: legal, media and public relations, international advocacy, and finance and administration. Adalah began instituting initial changes in 8/08 with the hiring of a Finance Director, C.P.A. Ghassan Kharouba, and the issuance of new financial procedures.

During the first half of 2009, the Board and staff will hold meetings to discuss and consider the 100-page report of the organizational consultant. Additional changes will be instituted in each of Adalah's departments in 2009, evaluation mechanisms and criteria put into practice, and organizational manuals of policies and procedures produced.

Interns/Fellows

Isabelle Humphries, a British journalist and Ph.D. candidate in Middle East History, completed a three-month international media fellowship with Adalah. **Kelli Barton**, a law student at New York University Law School, interned with Adalah during the summer of 2008. **Belkis Wille**, a new graduate, received a one-year scholarship from Harvard University to intern with Adalah beginning in 9/08.

Staff Honors

Adalah Attorney Sawsan Zaher received a fellowship from the Open Society Institute and spent the fall of 2008 at Columbia University Law School as a visiting scholar with the Public Interest Law Institute (PILI). She gave important lectures on Adalah's work at Yale Law School on the citizenship law case, and at the New Israel Fund (NIF) Forum, attended by 250 people in 2/06. She was also named as one of the 50 most influential people in field of education and was qualified as an expert at the UN Forum on Minority Rights.

Adalah Attorney Suhad Bishara and Adalah Urban Planner Hana Hamdan were awarded a bonus and the honor of "staff members of the year 2008" by Adalah. They received this award in recognition of

their great effort and achievement in Land and Planning Rights cases and objections throughout the year.

Board of Directors

- Chairman, Prof. Marwan Dwairy
- Dr. Thabet Abu Ras
- Ms. Suhad Aga, Advocate.
- Prof. Muhammad Haj-Yahia
- Dr. Hala Khoury-Bisharat, Advocate
- Fuad Sultani, Advocate
- Dr. Mahmoud Yazbak

Audit Control Committee

- Muhammad Miari, Advocate
- Wael Rabi, Advocate

Staff

- *Founder and General/Legal Director*
Attorney Hassan Jabareen
- *Legal Department*
Attorneys: Adel Badir, Abeer Baker, Suhad Bishara, Nabeel Dakwar (through 8/08), Fatmeh El-Ajou, Morad El-Sana (NIF fellowship), Orna Kohn, Sawsan Zaher
Legal Fellow: Rana Abed-Asali (OSI-CEU Fellowship from 10/08)
Urban Planner: Hana Hamdan
Public Outreach: Salah Muhsin (through 8/08)
Stagaires: Salem Abu-Medeghem, Haneen Naamnih
- *Media and Public Relations Department*
Director: Eva Mousa (on leave from 11/08);
Coordinator: Christine Khalil (through 8/08) and Salah Muhsin (from 9/08)
Web Editor: Bilal Zahra
Hebrew Editor: Ran Shapira
- *International Advocacy Department*
Director: Rina Jabareen, Esq.
Coordinator: Katie Hesketh
Researcher: Dr. Maha El-Taji (through 10/08);
Gabrielle Rubin (from 12/08)
Fellow: Belkis Wille (from 9/08)
- *Administration and Finance Department*
Finance Director: Ghassan Kharouba
Office Manager: Fathiyya Hussein
Assistant: Christine Nasrallah
Accountant: Basheer Geraisy (through 8/08)