



Adalah NGO Report to the UN Committee on the Rights of the Child Ahead of its Pre-Sessional Working Group

Submitted 20 January 2023

Adalah is pleased to submit this report to the Committee on the Rights of the Child, in view of Israel's Third periodic report on its implementation of the Convention on the Rights of the Child ahead of the Committee's 94th pre-sessional working group. In this report, Adalah demonstrates Israel's violations of the Convention, both in Israel and in the Occupied Palestinian Territory (OPT). This submission is based on information contained in a range of publications by Adalah, and its legal work before the Israeli courts and state authorities. Specifically, this report draws attention to Israel's violations of the Convention in four main fields – incidents of Israel's armed forces killing and injuring Palestinian children and the associated lack of accountability; violations of Palestinian children's rights to education; poverty, food insecurity and lack of access to health care services for Palestinian children; and the repercussions of Israel's ban on Palestinian family unification for children.

Adalah is an independent human rights organization and legal center, founded in 1996. Its mission is to promote human rights in Israel in general and the rights of the Palestinian minority, citizens of Israel, in particular. This work also includes promoting and defending the human rights of all individuals subject to the jurisdiction of the State of Israel, including Palestinian residents of the OPT. Adalah works before Israeli courts to protect the human rights of Palestinians in Israel and in the OPT.

Israel's Armed Forces Killing and Injuring Palestinian Children and Lack of Accountability (Articles 6, 37 of the CRC)

We note that in 2013, in its previous review of Israel, the Committee urged the State of Israel to “put an end to all killings and injuring of children, investigate immediately and effectively all such crimes, bring the perpetrators to justice and take all necessary measures to provide child victims of these human rights violations with possibilities for adequate compensation, recovery and social reintegration.” (CRC/C/ISR/CO/2-4, para. 26.)

A number of UN bodies have since reaffirmed the Committee's concerns regarding Israel's use of excessive force against Palestinians, including minors, and the lack of accountability for the killing and injury of Palestinians. The UN Committee Against Torture called on Israel in 2016 to “make more vigorous efforts to effectively prevent and sanction incidents of excessive force, including by ensuring that...All instances and allegations of excessive use of force are

investigated promptly, effectively and impartially by an independent body, that alleged perpetrators are duly prosecuted and, if found guilty, adequately sanctioned” (CAT/C/ISR/CO/5, paras. 32-33). In its February 2019 report, the UN Commission of Inquiry on the 2018 protests in the OPT¹ (see further details below) found that the “Government of Israel has consistently failed to meaningfully investigate and prosecute commanders and soldiers for crimes and violations committed against Palestinians or to provide reparation to victims in accordance with international norms.” (A/HRC/40/74, para. 111.)

Since the Committee’s 2013 report, Israel has continued to employ excessive force, including lethal force and use of live ammunition, against Palestinians, including children, and to grant sweeping impunity to its armed forces when Palestinians are killed or wounded – in violation of international law. Such practices constitute a violation of the rights to life, survival, and development of children (CRC Article 6), and of the prohibition on subjecting children to torture or other cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment (CRC Article 37), in addition to violations of Israeli domestic law, including the Youth Law (Trial, Punishment and Modes of Treatment) Law No. 5731-1971 (hereinafter referred to as the Youth Law).

In 2022 alone, Israeli forces killed 36 Palestinian children living in the occupied West Bank with live ammunition (as of November 2022)², and killed eight children, and injured another 49, during its military attacks on the Gaza Strip.³

Israel's military offensive on the Gaza Strip 2014

In July 2014, Israel launched a military offensive on the Gaza Strip, which it codenamed “Operation Protective Edge” (OPE), and which resulted in the killing of 2,251 Palestinians, the vast majority of them civilians, of whom 299 were women and 551 children.⁴

Adalah and Al Mezan Center for Human Rights filed criminal complaints regarding 28 incidents to the Military Advocate General (MAG) and the Attorney General (AG) concerning suspected criminal violations committed by Israel against Palestinian civilians during the military offensive and demanded independent investigations. None of these cases resulted in any genuine investigations, indictments or criminal proceedings. As of 2022, over 91% of the “exceptional incidents” referred to the MAG Corps involving alleged international humanitarian law (IHL)

¹ See report issued by the independent international commission of inquiry on the protests in the Occupied Palestinian Territory, submitted to the Human Rights Council in its Fortieth session [Report of the UN Commission of Inquiry on the 2018 protests in the OPT](#), 2019.

² According to documentation published by Defense for Children Palestine, available at: [DCI-Palestine](#)

³ According to a statistical update published by Al Mezan Center For Human Rights, available at: [On World Children's Day, Al Mezan calls on the international community to enhance the protection of Palestinian children amid continuing Israeli violence against them](#)

⁴ OCHA, "[Key figures on the 2014 hostilities](#)". Four Palestinian NGOs that documented the impacts of OPE and verified the field research afterwards reported that 2,219 people were killed, of whom 299 were women and 556 children. See '[Operation Protective Edge in Numbers](#)', page 15.

violations during Israel's 2014 offensive on Gaza had not been investigated, and to date, no commander or soldier was ever prosecuted for violations of IHL.⁵

One particularly egregious example of Israel's failure to carry out a genuine and effective investigation into alleged war crimes committed by its armed forces is the 'Bakr boys' case.⁶ In July 2014, the Israeli air force fired missiles that killed four children of the Bakr family while they were playing on a fishing beach west of Gaza City, in full view of foreign journalists. The four boys are Ahed (9 years), Zakaria (10 years), Mohammed (11 years), and Ismail (9 years).

Five years after the boys were killed, in September 2019, the AG announced that he had fully adopted the MAG's decision to close the investigation. A petition filed by Adalah, Al Mezan Center For Human Rights, and the Palestinian Centre for Human Rights was rejected by the Israeli Supreme Court on 24 April 2022, after holding only one hearing on the case in January 2022.⁷

The Court held that the petition must be rejected due to "the lack of grounds for intervention in the discretion of the Attorney General who decided to reject [the petitioner's] objections to the MAG's decision." The Court noted in this regard that judicial intervention should take place only in "rare and exceptional cases".⁸ The ruling relies, *inter alia*, on secret evidence, reviewed only by the Supreme Court, without the presence of the petitioners' lawyers, evidence that, according to the Court, substantiated the Israeli military's claim that the perimeter of the area attacked was being used by Hamas forces. The Court failed to provide an in-depth analysis of the evidence and arguments brought forward by the petitioners and adopted the State's argument in full. This case clearly illustrates the Israeli military's indiscriminate, lethal assaults on Palestinian civilians, including children, during the 2014 Gaza war and the willingness of the Israeli legal system to defend Israeli aggression by affording total impunity and discretion to the Israeli military.

2014 Protests in Israel and occupied East Jerusalem

⁵ According to a response to a Freedom of Information Act request filed by Adalah.

⁶ Another case exemplifying Israel's lethal assaults on Palestinian children living in Gaza from the 2014 Military offensive on Gaza, and Israel's shielding of those responsible from criminal liability, is the direct attack on the UNRWA school in Rafah, whereby 15 people were killed, including 8 children, and 25 injured. Adalah and Al Mezan filed a complaint and appealed to the AG after the MAG closed the case files. To date, no investigation has been opened. See Adalah's report *Challenging the Israeli Attorney General's Conception of Sovereignty: The Issue of Jurisdiction concerning the 'Situation of Palestine' before The International Criminal Court* (June 2020)

⁷ HCJ 8008/20, *Atef Ahad Subhi Bakr et al v. Military Advocate General et al.*; and Joint Press Release: [Israeli Supreme Court rejects petition against closure of investigation into Bakr boys' killings during 2014 Gaza war](#) (24 April 2022). See judgment [Hebrew] here:

https://www.adalah.org/uploads/uploads/Bakr_Case_Supreme_Court_decision_240422.pdf

⁸ In paragraph 11 of the judgment the Court details which instances fall under "rare and exceptional cases", including decisions taken in bad faith; conflict of interests and extreme unreasonableness. See judgment [Hebrew] here: https://www.adalah.org/uploads/uploads/Bakr_Case_Supreme_Court_decision_240422.pdf

In the summer of 2014, Palestinian citizens of Israel and Palestinian residents of occupied East Jerusalem took to the streets to protest against the military offensive in the Gaza Strip and the murder of 16-year-old Mohammad Abu Khdeir from the Shu'afat neighborhood of Jerusalem, in which the child was abducted and burned alive by Israeli Jewish settlers.

The Israeli police detained around 1,500 protesters, with one-third of the 1,500 arrested Palestinian protestors being minors. The police violated minors' rights during arrests, detentions, and interrogations, and many minors were arrested and interrogated in the late hours of the night, were questioned by police without the presence of a parent, and were denied access to a lawyer.

Adalah collected extensive documentation of violations of the rights of Palestinian citizens of Israel, including minors, during their arrests and detentions during this period. For instance, in July 2014, the police arrested four Palestinian minors between 15 and 17 years of age late at night. Police interrogated the minors during the early hours of the morning, practices that are prohibited by law. Police additionally conducted the interrogations without the presence of the detained youths' parents, and the police prevented lawyers from meeting with the detained youth for several hours, in violation of Israeli domestic law and CRC Article 37.⁹

The Great March of Return - 2018

On 30 March 2018, Palestinians living under blockade in the Gaza Strip began a series of weekly protests known as "The Great March of Return" (GMR), which took place for almost two years. The protesters' main demands included the return of Palestinian refugees and their descendants, living in Gaza and elsewhere, to their towns and villages of origin in Israel, and an end to Israel's blockade of Gaza. The Israeli military responded to these peaceful civilian protests with excessive, and often lethal, force. In total, 217 Palestinians were killed at the protests, including 48 children and two women, and over 19,000 persons were wounded, including 4,966 children and 867 women. 9,515 persons were shot by live fire.¹⁰

Adalah and other human rights organizations submitted two urgent petitions to the Israeli Supreme Court in April 2018, demanding that the court order the Israeli military to cease using snipers and live ammunition to disperse the GMR protesters.¹¹ The petitioners argued that the rules of engagement (ROE) employed by the Israeli military, which authorized the deadly open-fire policy against protesters, were patently excessive and illegal, as evidenced by the high

⁹ On 6 July 2014, Adalah filed an appeal to the Nazareth District Court against the decision of the lower court to extend the detention of four minor youth aged 15 to 17-years-old. The minors were charged with "participating in riots", "threatening public safety on a highway" and "assaulting police officers". See Adalah Press Release: [110 Palestinian citizens of Israel remain in detention after largest wave of arrests since - Adalah](#)

¹⁰ See, Al Mezan, [Statistics of the victims of the Great March Of Return from the 30 March 2018 until 31 March 2020](#) [in Arabic].

¹¹ HCJ 3003/18 *Yesh Din, et. al v. IDF Chief of Staff et al.* and HCJ 3250/18, *Adalah, et. al v. IDF Chief of Staff, et al.* (cases dismissed 24 May 2018). See Adalah Press Release [Adalah & Al Mezan petition Supreme Court: Order Israeli army to stop using snipers, live ammunition against Gaza protests](#) (24 April 2018).

number of resultant deaths and injuries. The petition filed by Adalah and the Al Mezan Center for Human Rights included 12 video clips documenting Israeli soldiers shooting unarmed protesters who posed no threat to anyone (including a video documenting the killing of 14-year-old Mohammed Ibrahim Ayoub).

On 24 May 2018, the Supreme Court unanimously rejected the petitions, thereby sanctioning the Israeli military's continued use of snipers and live fire against Palestinian GMR protesters. The Supreme Court failed to intervene in the military's decisions, and thus failed to provide any legal accountability or other remedy to the victims.

According to the UN Commission of Inquiry on the 2018 protests in the OPT, "the use of live ammunition by Israeli security forces against demonstrators was unlawful", as the protesters did not pose any threat to the lives of Israeli soldiers or civilians or participate directly in hostilities.¹²

The May 2021 Events – Palestinian Citizens of Israel

During May 2021, there was a swift and deadly escalation in violence in Israel and in the OPT. Hostilities were sparked by Israel's violent repression of demonstrations against the imminent forced displacement of Palestinian refugee families from the Sheikh Jarrah neighborhood in occupied East Jerusalem, and then intensified when Israeli police stormed and blockaded the Al-Aqsa Mosque compound, attacking worshippers and preventing them from praying at the site during the holy month of Ramadan. As militant groups in Gaza retaliated against Israel's assaults on Al-Aqsa, the Israeli military responded by launching massive airstrikes that killed an estimated 240 Palestinians, including 59 children, and injuring another 1,968, including 630 children.¹³

The situation in Israel also quickly deteriorated as Palestinian citizens of Israel (PCI) took to the streets in Palestinian towns and "mixed towns" to protest in solidarity with Palestinians in East Jerusalem and Gaza. These protests were met with police brutality and a draconian clampdown on freedom of speech and assembly. Israel's Defense Minister declared an extraordinary "civil emergency" in Lydd (Lod), a first in Israel since military rule ended in 1966. Organized, ultra-right wing Jewish Israelis, including settlers, attacked PCI and their property and desecrated mosques, often with police protection and collusion.

According to information obtained through a Freedom of Information Act request filed by Adalah, Israeli police arrested 291 minors during the May 2021 Events. Adalah documented severe violations of the rights of PCI children during May 2021. Police violated minors' rights both during arrests, and afterward, through their treatment in police stations. During arrests, police, including undercover officers, used excessive force against minors and carried out arrests

¹² [Report of the independent international commission of inquiry on the protests in the Occupied Palestinian Territory - A/HRC/40/74](#)

¹³ See [Statistical report on May 2021 assault on the Gaza Strip issued by Al Mezan, PCHR and Al-Haq](#) (February 2022)

of minors at their homes in the middle of the night; at police stations, police delayed access to lawyers and prevented parents' presence in the interrogation, despite provisions of Israel's Youth Law – which prescribe that suspected minors are entitled to have their parents or another close relative present at the interrogation – and failed to even inform parents of their minor children's arrests and whereabouts. These practices constitute a clear violation of the Convention (Article 37) and Israel's Youth Law.

Examples of violations of the rights of child Palestinian citizens of Israel during May 2021 include:

- The Nazareth police engaged in rampant, systemic attacks and brutal beatings of Palestinian citizens of Israel – protesters, minors, bystanders, and attorneys – inside the city's police station in May 2021. The graphic testimonies collected by Adalah tell a story of physical, verbal and psychological abuse and indicate that Israeli officers were running what amounted to a “torture room”, as described by detainees. Most of the violent arrests of and attacks on PCI in the city were carried out by Israeli special police forces, including undercover (“*mista'arvim*”) officers posing as Palestinians. Many of the detainees were also denied urgent medical care for wounds resulting from the beatings.¹⁴

Adalah submitted a comprehensive complaint to the Israeli Police Investigations Department (PID or 'Mahash') in this case, detailing, *inter alia*, violations of minors' rights. For instance, Adalah described a case whereby a minor was taken to the police station on the night between the 9th and 10th of May and was released at 2:00 AM, and police gave no notification to his parent or lawyer about his arrest or release. The minor displayed visible signs of violence on his body upon his release and told his lawyer that his requests to consult a lawyer or speak with a family member had been denied. In June 2022, the PID rejected the complaint and decided not to open a criminal investigation. The police station commander continues to hold his position, despite Adalah's demands to have him suspended. Adalah will be filing an appeal of this decision in the coming days.

- Four people, Palestinian citizens of Israel, including three minors (TAZ – aged 17 – and YM and AA – both 12 years old), were injured, one severely and hospitalized in intensive care, in Jaffa-Tel Aviv by rubber bullets fired by police in May 2021. The police fired randomly, injuring the minors, despite the fact that they were not participating in the protests and were merely passing by. Adalah filed a complaint to the PID on 6 September 2021, but the PID rejected the complaint. On 29 September 2022, Adalah filed an appeal to the State Attorney's Office, arguing that the PID had failed to conduct an adequate investigation, did not summon witnesses, and did not use the means at its disposal to legally establish a factual basis.

¹⁴ Adalah Press Release: [What happened in the 'torture room' at Israel's police station in Nazareth?, 7 June 2021](#), see Adalah's [complaint](#) [Hebrew].

As far as children Palestinian citizens of Israel are concerned, the Israeli law enforcement authorities consistently ignore special guarantees and safeguards afforded to minors under Israeli Law (the Youth Law) during arrests and detentions under the façade of “national emergency”. Many of the tactics employed during arrests and detentions against Palestinian citizens of Israel during May 2021 are also used routinely against Palestinian children in the OPT.

Israel's self-exemption of responsibility and liability for damages, injuries, and deaths of Palestinians in Gaza

In July 2022, the Supreme Court of Israel ruled that Israel was not liable for damages for the shooting and serious wounding of an unarmed 15-year-old Palestinian boy, Attiya Nabaheen, in Gaza near his home in 2014, and more broadly found that Gazans are not entitled to seek compensation for damages from Israel.¹⁵ The decision was based on Amendment No. 8 of Israel's Civil Wrongs Law (State Responsibility) of 1952, enacted in 2012, which determines that residents of a territory declared by the Israeli government as “enemy territory” – as Gaza was declared in 2007 – are not eligible to seek compensation from Israel for any reason. The Supreme Court upheld a decision of the Be'er Sheva District Court from November 2018 in a petition filed by Adalah and Al Mezan on behalf of the Nabaheen family against the Israeli military. The petitioners brought evidence before the Court that Israeli troops had opened fire on Attiya Nabaheen on 16 November 2014, while he was on his family's private property. As a result of the shooting, Nabaheen was left a quadriplegic, expected to be confined to a wheelchair for life. The petitioners argued that Amendment No. 8 was in violation of international law, which requires that protected civilians be entitled to effective legal remedies, including compensation.

The ruling grants comprehensive immunity to the Israeli military and the State of Israel for illegal and criminal actions taken in the Gaza Strip and leaves their victims without any civil remedy under Israeli domestic law. It violates the right of Gaza residents to effectuate their right under international humanitarian law to an effective legal remedy from Israel, as the occupying power.

The Court, however, ruled that the law was not contrary to international law, and that, even if it were, “the Knesset [Israeli Parliament] has the power to override the rules of international law.” The Court acknowledged that the law infringed on Palestinian victims' fundamental rights, namely the right to life, bodily integrity, dignity, liberty, property, and the right of effective legal remedy. However, it ruled that the level of protection of fundamental rights afforded to Nabaheen was limited due to his residence in Gaza – an “enemy territory”. The Court further determined that the law serves an appropriate purpose, namely “the prevention of economic or moral assistance to the enemy”. According to the Court, this rationale justifies the sweeping

¹⁵ (Supreme Court) Civil Appeal 993/19, *Nabaheen v. Israeli Defense Ministry*. See Adalah Press Release, [In a most dangerous precedent, Israeli Supreme Court OKs sweeping immunity for the state, denies - Adalah](#), 7 July 2022.

infringement of the fundamental rights of Palestinian civilians injured by Israel's armed forces. This rationale not only indicates that the legal system is completely willing to shield its armed forces from accountability, but also that it views itself as a part of the war against Palestinians in Gaza. On 25 August 2022, the organizations filed a request to hold an additional Supreme Court hearing in the case, arguing that the SCT's ruling constituted a new legal precedent that contradicts a previous 2006 ruling, decided by an extended panel of the Supreme Court.¹⁶

Adalah requests that this Committee recommend an immediate end to Israel's indiscriminate, lethal assaults on Palestinian children in the OPT, including the use of live ammunition.

Adalah requests that this Committee urge the State of Israel to ensure that Palestinian children - citizens of Israel and those living in the OPT – are afforded guarantees and safeguards in accordance with the articles of this Convention and Israeli law during arrest and detention, including access to a lawyer; being able to contact parents; and the presence of a parent or a close relative during interrogation. Adalah further requests that this Committee urge Israel to ensure that children are not subject to ill-treatment and torture during arrest and detention.

Adalah requests that this Committee urge the State of Israel to put an end to its policy of near-blanket impunity to its armed forces and carry out thorough, effective, independent, and impartial investigations into allegations of human rights violations against Palestinian citizens of Israel and Palestinians living in the OPT to ensure that perpetrators are prosecuted and sanctioned in a manner commensurate with the gravity of the acts committed, and that victims and their families are provided with effective remedies, including equal and effective access to justice and reparations.

Rights to Education (Articles 2, 8, 28, 29, 30 of the CRC)

This section primarily addresses the educational issues faced by Palestinian children who attend school in Israel, particularly, Palestinian citizens of Israel, a population today of about 1.5 million people, or about 20% of the country's population.¹⁷ About a quarter of children in the Israeli school system are Palestinian, or approximately 450,000 children.¹⁸

Disparities in and lack of funding for Palestinian children and schools

In the Committee's 2013 review of Israel, it observed the "segregated school systems" in place for Jewish and Palestinian children and noted the "lower investment in the education system for Arab children which results in a severe shortage of classrooms, in substandard conditions and quality of teaching, low academic results and high school dropout" (CRC/C/ISR/CO/2-4, para. 11). Since the Committee's last report on Israel, Israel undertook steps to entrench racial segregation in education. A substantial component of how Israel negatively impacts the right of

¹⁶ Case citation: Additional Civil Hearing (SCT) 5653/22 Attiya Nabaheen v. Israeli Defense Ministry (case pending)

¹⁷ Adalah Primer, [Palestinian Citizens of Israel](#).

¹⁸ Zama Coursen-Neff, [Discrimination Against Palestinian Arab Children In The Israeli Educational System](#).

Palestinian children to obtain education is done through the provision of separate and unequal funding for Palestinian schools and Palestinian municipalities generally.

Adalah has represented numerous of these Palestinian families, as well as Palestinian municipalities in Israel, in their efforts to secure equal funding for the schools that their children attend. In 2021, during the COVID-19 outbreak, for example, the Haifa Municipality – a city with a Palestinian population of approximately 60,000 people¹⁹ – provided funding for students' transportation only to Jewish private schools, while Palestinian schools received no such financial support, despite the fact that 70% of Palestinian children attending school in Haifa attend private schools.²⁰ Though the municipality ultimately responded to Adalah's letter demanding a fair and equal allocation of public money, the municipality has yet to provide information on what criteria they will use to apportion funds in the future.

After-school programs for children are also a consistent target of unequal distribution of funding from the state and are illustrative of the larger pattern of discrimination against Palestinian children in Israeli schools. In one instance, for example, a group of six relatively impoverished Palestinian municipalities that are part of an otherwise wealthy local regional council were effectively prohibited from participation in after-school programs – known as “*Nitzanim*” – due to the high cost of fees set by the region's overall prosperity.²¹ The Misgav Regional Council (MRC) – comprised of 35 towns – has a socio-economic ranking of 7 out of 10, while the six Palestinian towns within it are all ranked at levels 1-3, among the poorest in the country. The after-school program in question, funded partly by the Ministry of Education, was meant to provide educational benefits to children and allow their parents to work longer hours. However, families in the disadvantaged Palestinian municipalities have to pay a higher participation fee set by the government based on the MRC's overall prosperity, not taking into consideration the comparative poverty of the Palestinian localities included within it, if they want their children to take part in this program, and are disqualified from subsidies. As a result of this *de facto* exclusion, Adalah filed a petition to the Supreme Court, demanding that the state reconsider its criteria for allocating subsidies. Though the Ministry of Education announced that it was examining its budgeting model for the national *Nitzanim* national program, exactly how the program will be reconsidered remains undetermined. As has been the case since the program's inception, today, because the majority of parents cannot afford to pay the elevated fees, the *Nitzanim* program does not operate in the six Palestinian towns in Misgav.

Lack of access to education

Lack of access to education for Palestinian children is a rampant problem throughout all areas under Israel's control. Israel employs a variety of tactics to prevent Palestinian children from accessing adequate education, including disparate funding, outright segregation, and other

¹⁹ Middle East Eye, [One year on, Haifa's uprising is inspiring a united Palestinian movement](#), 19 May 2022.

²⁰ Adalah Press Brief, [Following Adalah's intervention, Haifa will ensure clear and fair standards in distribution of funds to city's private schools](#), 11 September, 2022.

²¹ Adalah Press Release, [Adalah & Arab villages petition Israeli Supreme Court for subsidized after-school kids' programs](#), 14 September 2020.

discriminatory policies exemplified by Israel's consistent policies of Jewish supremacy and racial subjugation. An example is the denial of access to Arabic-language schools and/or state-funded transportation to such schools for Palestinian children citizens of Israel. Following a petition filed by Palestinian residents against Karmiel, a Jewish town in Israel with no Arabic-language schools, in which the petitioners demanded transportation for their children to attend Arabic schools in other towns, a court found that such assistance would provide incentives for Arab families to move into Karmiel, and that such influx of Arab residents would "alter the demographic balance and damage the city's character".²²

The court's ruling relied on Israel's racist Jewish Nation-State Law (2018), which constitutionally enshrines Jewish supremacy and the identity of the State of Israel as the nation-state of the Jewish people alone.²³ Since its passage in 2018, this law has already been used to deprive Palestinians of basic, let alone equal, resources and is one of many means through which the state limits Palestinian children's access to education.

Segregation and discrimination. First and foremost, direct racial subjugation by the State of Israel prevents children from accessing adequate education. Examples include: a 2022 case in which the municipal school district in a mixed Palestinian-Jewish city – Lydd (Lod) – refused to register several Palestinian citizen children for kindergartens by unlawfully conditioning their registration on payment of past fees and online registration – due to high poverty rates in Palestinian communities, the conditioning of registration on payment of fees has a clear discriminatory purpose and effect²⁴; a 2020 case of an 11-year-old Palestinian child who was prohibited from attending a Jewish school closer to his home²⁵; and the 2020 case of a Palestinian girl who was denied permission to attend kindergarten in a nearby Jewish town until legal intervention by Adalah forced the municipality to admit her to the kindergarten. These examples speak to a broader problem by which Israel seeks to maintain a segregated school system and keep Palestinian children out of Jewish schools – even when individual Palestinian parents seek to have their children enrolled in Jewish schools – in order to preserve a Jewish-only school system for Jewish schoolchildren.

Lack of Internet access. The Government of Israel's continued denial of Palestinian children in Israel's access to the Internet is widening the 'digital divide' between Palestinian and Jewish citizens of Israel, a situation that has a direct impact on children's education, particularly in the wake of the COVID-19 pandemic. At the onset of the pandemic, some 150,000 Palestinian students in Israel did not have access to computers, electricity, or internet access in order to

²² Adalah Press Release, [Israeli court relies on Jewish Nation-State Law in racist ruling: Municipal funding of school busing not required for Arab kids as it would encourage Arab families to move into 'Jewish city'](#), 30 November 2020.

²³ Adalah Special Report, [Israel's Jewish Nation-State Law - Adalah](#), 20 December 2020.

²⁴ Adalah wrote a letter to the municipality in this case, and although the city denied any allegations of discrimination in Adalah's letter, they agreed to let the family register their children shortly thereafter.

²⁵ After Adalah intervened on the boy's behalf, the city ultimately allowed the boy to register and begin 6th grade at the nearby Jewish school. See Adalah Press Release, [Following Adalah intervention, Israeli town allows Arab sixth grader to transfer to Jewish school adjacent to his house](#), 7 October 2020.

access distance learning.²⁶ The government has expressly excluded the majority of Palestinian localities from access to advanced internet connection. In 2021, the Israeli Ministry of Communication published a list of localities that would be prioritized for connection to advanced internet access, and of those 244 localities, only seven were Palestinian towns and villages in Israel, and none were Bedouin villages in the Naqab (Negev) area of southern Israel. During the COVID-19 pandemic, this already wide ‘digital divide’ grew to debilitating proportions; as a result of the lockdowns enforced during the pandemic and the increased digitization of educational and day-to-day services such as healthcare, unemployment services and other state welfare benefits, Palestinian children are being increasingly left behind. At the onset of the pandemic, more than 50,000 Palestinian Bedouin children in the Naqab lacked internet connectivity and electricity – in both recognized and unrecognized villages – and were therefore wholly unable to access distance-learning.²⁷

Lack of education access in the Naqab (Negev). Palestinian Bedouin children in the Naqab (Negev) face particularly acute access problems pertaining to education (for more information on Bedouins in the Naqab, see *Section: Poverty, Access to Health, and Food Security*). Bedouins in the Naqab experience some of the highest rates of poverty in the country, with over two-thirds of Naqab Bedouins living in poverty.²⁸ Children often have to travel long distances to attend schools, and those schools are severely overcrowded and under-resourced. It has been estimated that around 6,000 Bedouin children travel dozens of kilometers per day to attend school.²⁹ As a result of a combination of these problems and deprivation of resources, the dropout rate of Bedouin children from school is around 30%, as compared to 5% of all students in Israel. Even more stark, data from the 2015-2016 school year showed that 11% of all Bedouin children were not in school at all.³⁰

Over the reporting period, Adalah undertook several cases to improve the access of Bedouin children living in the Naqab to education, particularly for early childhood education. Approximately 75% of 3-4 year old Bedouin children in Israel do not have any educational framework, as compared with less than 5% for Jewish Israeli children of the same age.³¹ Some examples of Adalah’s interventions include: a 2020 case in which 2,200 Bedouin preschool children in 20 Naqab villages had been stuck at home for a month after the Education Ministry

²⁶ Adalah Press Release, [Israel’s plan to distribute computers too little, too late for 150,000 Arab schoolkids stuck at home due to COVID-19](#), 19 October 2020.

²⁷ Adalah filed a Supreme Court petition, demanding that the children be provided with internet access so that they could continue their education, but the Court dismissed the petition on the grounds that the state had ordered all schools to reopen (though thousands of Bedouin children had not, in fact, returned to school). To read more about this case and Adalah’s other legal actions in the face of the COVID-19 pandemic, see [COVID-19 | Latest updates on Adalah’s coronavirus legal work](#), 19 April 2021.

²⁸ Adalah, [Palestinian Bedouin Citizens of Israel in the Naqab \(Negev\): A Primer](#), August 2022.

²⁹ Zama Coursen-Neff, [Discrimination Against Palestinian Arab Children In The Israeli Educational System](#).

³⁰ Adalah & Negev Coexistence Forum for Civil Equality (NCF), [Joint NGO Submission to the UN Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination Re: List of Themes for the State of Israel Violations of the ICERD against the Arab Bedouin citizens of Israel living in the Naqab/Negev desert](#), 12 September 2019

³¹ Adalah Press Release, [On the International Day for the Protection of the Child: Blatant discrimination in early childhood education for Arab children in Israel](#), 1 June 2015.

failed to transfer funding for their school buses to the Neve Midbar Regional Council, due to a budget dispute³²; the case of the Bedouin village of Al-Zarnouq, with approximately 5,000 residents, in which children had to travel up to 90 kilometers to attend high school until legal intervention eventually led the government to agree in 2019 to open a high school in the village³³; a 2016 case that sought to guarantee access to education for Bedouin children aged 3-4 years-old (via the Compulsory Education Law) in the town of Alsira³⁴; the 2019 case involving the Bedouin village of Al Rowais, where, again, no kindergarten was in place for the 140 children residing there³⁵; and in 2022, the case of Khasem Zaneh, in which the studies of approximately 300 students were abruptly put on hold when their school was closed due to a Ministry of Education dispute over the principal.³⁶ Though individuals in these cases received resolutions in some instances, the reality is that these types of issues happen on a consistent basis to large numbers of Palestinian children and their families, such that case-by-case legal intervention is insufficient to resolve the need at scale.

Bedouin villages also face severe issues with school overcrowding; per a 2017 Knesset report, there is an acute shortage of kindergarten classrooms in unrecognized Bedouin villages, and the Ministry of Education (MoE) estimated the need for an additional 1,236 schools and kindergarten classrooms in Bedouin townships and villages.³⁷ This is the situation in the case of Wadi al Naam, where dozens of children were unable to attend kindergarten from the beginning of the 2022 school year due to the lack of sufficient classrooms and proper learning conditions, in violation of the Compulsory Education Law.³⁸ The problems of overcrowding and lack of sufficient schools in Bedouin villages is compounded by the lack of transportation to any nearby schools. In 2017, a group of Bedouin families fought to have bus stops constructed nearby 47 schools in the Naqab in order for children to be transported to school safely,³⁹ and in 2022, a

³² After Adalah's legal intervention, the Council agreed to negotiations and resumed bus service shortly thereafter. See Adalah Press Release, [2,200 Bedouin preschool kids stuck at home for a month due to school bus budget dispute; Adalah files urgent court petition](#), 13 February 2020.

³³ Though right-wing organizations attempted to shut down the building of the school as a supposed breach of planning and building regulations, the high school was eventually opened in September 2019 and now serves between 300-500 students per year. See Adalah Press Release, [Adalah demands Israel open high school in unrecognized Bedouin village of Al Zarnouq](#), 18 November 2018.

³⁴ Adalah Press Release, [Adalah petitions Be'er Sheva court for preschool education in unrecognized Bedouin village of Alsira](#), 5 May 2016.

³⁵ Adalah Press Release, [Adalah demands the opening of a kindergarten in the unrecognized Bedouin village of Al Rowais in the Naqab](#), 11 September 2019.

³⁶ In response, Adalah sent an urgent letter to the Ministry, demanding the immediate reopening of the school, after which, the school was reopened.

³⁷ Knesset Research and Information Center, "The Bedouin education in the Negev 2018: Chosen figures", 18 December 2018, p.3 (in Hebrew): <https://tinyurl.com/y9pw2uyu>.

³⁸ After Adalah's numerous demands to the local Regional Council to resolve the overcrowding concerns, the relevant authorities advised that they would address the issues, but many of the students remain out of school.

³⁹ Though the state agreed to the demands for bus stop installation, implementation has continued to be delayed as a result of alleged budgeting issues. See Adalah Press Release, [Court accepts state commitment to build school bus stops for Bedouin kids but refrains from ordering construction timeline](#), 13 June 2018.

group of residents in the Naqab village of Tel Arad pressed the government to provide paved roads in the village, the lack of which regularly prevented children from attending school.⁴⁰

Bans on Palestinian identity in education

Palestinian children's rights to education are further violated by the State of Israel's attempts to ban expressions of their collective national identity, history, and language in all aspects of their lives, and specifically, in their education. As the Committee stated in its previous recommendations, "The Committee...reminds the State party of its duty to ensure that Palestinian children are educated with respect to their cultural identity, language and values and therefore urges the State party to cancel the prohibitions of using Palestinian textbooks and curricula."

Two major pieces of legislation in Israel work to undermine expressions of Palestinian identity: the 'Nakba Law' – which penalizes commemoration of the 'Nakba' ("catastrophe" in Arabic), which refers to the 1948 forcible displacement of more than 750,000 Palestinians from their homes and land to areas outside the newly-established State of Israel – and the Jewish Nation-State Law. Israel's 'Nakba Law', an amendment passed in 2011, authorizes the Finance Minister to reduce state funding or support to an institution if it holds an activity that rejects the existence of Israel as a "Jewish and democratic state" or commemorates "Israel's Independence Day or the day on which the state was established as a day of mourning."⁴¹ The 2018 Jewish Nation-State Law (JNSL) – which has distinct characteristics of apartheid – guarantees the ethnic-religious character of Israel as exclusively Jewish and entrenches the privileges enjoyed by Jewish citizens, while simultaneously anchoring discrimination against Palestinian citizens of Israel and legitimizing exclusion, racism, and systemic inequality.⁴² Adalah filed Supreme Court petitions against both laws – in 2012 and 2018, respectively – both of which were rejected.⁴³ The Supreme Court upheld the Jewish Nation-State Law in a ten-to-one decision, without any consideration of Israel's obligations under this Convention and other human rights treaties, despite determinations by several UN human rights bodies that the law must be amended to be brought into line with international human rights law or repealed.⁴⁴

In 2022, these laws were used to uphold racist Israeli policies, including a policy whereby external providers of school programs who refused to declare that they recognize the Jewish character of the state and/or those who commemorate the *Nakba* were banned from working as service providers in schools. The state itself admitted that the ban was a curtailment of free

⁴⁰ In May 2022, the Ministry of Transport and Roads approved funding for a paved entry road and roads to schools in Tel Arad in the Naqab, after Adalah's multiple letters to the relevant ministries and private companies.

⁴¹ Adalah, [Discriminatory Law Database: "Nakba Law" - Amendment No. 40 to the Budgets Foundations Law](#).

⁴² Adalah Special Report, [Israel's Jewish Nation-State Law](#), 20 December 2020.

⁴³ Adalah Press Release, [Adalah and ACRI: Israeli High Court Ignored the Chilling Effect Already Caused by the "Nakba Law"](#), 5 January 2012; Adalah Press Release, [Israeli Supreme Court upholds the racist and discriminatory Jewish Nation-State Law](#), 8 July 2021.

⁴⁴ See the UN Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (E/C.12/ISR/CO/4, paras. 16-17) and the UN Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination (CERD/C/ISR/CO/17-19, paras. 13-14).

speech but nevertheless asserted its validity under the JNSL. Though the Ministry of Education ultimately revised the ban to only apply to the content of the educational programs, rather than to the providers themselves, the policy continues to severely infringe on the rights of Palestinian children to receive educational content that pertains to the Palestinian collective identity and narrative.

The state also systematically seeks to exclude and limit resources in Arabic, which up until recently (with the entry into force of the JNSL), was an official language of the state. For example, in 2019, the government started offering free preparatory classes only in Hebrew for the psychometric higher education eligibility exam, despite the fact that Palestinian students take the exam itself in Arabic. Following Adalah's legal intervention regarding the discriminatory policy, the state agreed to institute an additional preparatory course in Arabic, but it has yet to fulfill that commitment.⁴⁵

Suppression of Palestinian identity in schools is compounded by explicit efforts to propagate Jewish supremacy in the education system. In June 2019, for example, Adalah brought legal action against an online course that all high school students were required to complete in order to participate in overseas class trips.⁴⁶ The course requires students to watch a series of videos after which they must take a multiple choice exam, the correct answers of which promote racist ideology. This exam asks Palestinian high school students in the Israeli school system to assume to its racist values and specific political and Zionist views, violates the values of educational pluralism, and contravenes provisions of Israel's Education Law, which requires consideration of the "uniqueness" of the Palestinian minority citizens of Israel, recognizing its history, language, culture, and heritage.

Appointment of teachers. Israel further implements principles of subjugation through policies that govern the appointment of teachers in Palestinian schools. For example, the appointments of teachers in special education schools are made according to different criteria in Palestinian than Jewish-Israeli schools, and in the Palestinian schools, according to experts, the decisions are made based on "irrelevant" criteria that inhibit children's right to education.⁴⁷ The use of these different criteria severely limits the autonomy of Palestinian schools and allows the government of Israel to inject its own political motives and ideology into the process of screening Palestinian teachers who seek to teach in Palestinian schools.

Upcoming dangers pertaining to the new Israeli government. The new Israeli coalition government, inaugurated in late December 2022, has made clear that it intends to continue and expand the separate and unequal funding for Palestinian localities, in education and other

⁴⁵ Adalah Press Release, [Israel's Social Equality Ministry discriminates against Arab students, provides free psychometric prep course in Hebrew only](#), 2 January 2019.

⁴⁶ Adalah Press Release, [Israel forcing high school students to pass government propaganda course before going on overseas class trips](#), 4 July 2019.

⁴⁷ In February 2022, Adalah filed a court petition in this case, but in a highly prejudicial proceeding, the judge effectively threw out the case. See Adalah Press Release, [Adalah petitions Israeli Jerusalem District Court to cancel racist and discriminatory procedure for appointing teachers in Arab special education schools](#), 28 February 2022.

fields, as well to increase educational scholarships that are only available to Jewish Israelis, and in the absence of alternative scholarships for Palestinian children and youth.⁴⁸ It has also outlined in its foundational guiding principles and coalition agreements that it intends to promote Jewish identity and Zionism through its education policies and to prevent Palestinian teachers from being hired in schools if they express support for so-called ‘terrorism’, based on extremely vague and abstract definitions of the term, which are ripe for abuse and misuse.

Adalah urges the Committee to call on the Government of Israel to provide fair and equitable funding streams to Palestinian localities and schools and put an immediate end to its discriminatory procedures for funding state education programs, in order to close the gaps in the provision of education.

Adalah urges the Committee to call on the Government of Israel to provide proper access to education for Palestinian children, particularly Bedouins in the Naqab, who are in the most acute need, including access to adequate transportation, paved roads, internet capability, and the ability to promptly register and enroll in schools without discrimination.

Adalah urges the Committee to call on the Israeli Government to immediately cease its policies and practices that discriminate against Palestinian children by preventing educational expressions of their national and historical identity and their language.

Poverty, Access to Health and Food Security (Articles 19, 23, 24, and 26)

Palestinian citizens suffer from the highest poverty rates in Israel, and in particular, the Bedouin in the Naqab. Overall, according to a 2020 report of the Israeli National Insurance Institute, almost 39% of Palestinian families in Israel live in poverty,⁴⁹ and a staggering 59% of Bedouin families in the Naqab, compared with 20% among the general population in Israel. In prior reporting, the Committee on the Rights of the Child expressed its deep concerns about the increasing poverty among Palestinian children and, in particular, Bedouin children in the Naqab, 80% of which live under the poverty line.⁵⁰ Poverty is a major obstacle to development facing the Palestinian minority in Israel, and especially for the Bedouin.⁵¹ The Bedouin in the Naqab, and in particular children, lack basic necessities for adequate living conditions, especially in the ‘unrecognized villages’, which are not acknowledged by the Israeli Government and are

⁴⁸ Adalah Position Paper, [Analysis of the New Israeli Government’s Guiding Principles and Coalition Agreements and their Implications on Palestinians’ Rights](#), see Section V: Discrimination in education and Section IX: Separate and unequal funding for Palestinian localities in Israel, 10 January 2023.

⁴⁹ According to the National Insurance’s publication: 2021 Poverty and Social Gaps Report in Israel, English Press Release available at: [National Insurance’s publication: 2021 Poverty and Social Gaps Report in Israel - Press releases](#) (January 2023).

⁵⁰ The Israeli Institute for National Security 2018 report on poverty and inequality, [Dimensions of Poverty and Social Disparities-Annual Report](#) [Hebrew].

⁵¹ Committee on the Rights of the Child, [Concluding observations on the second to fourth periodic reports of Israel, adopted by the Committee at its sixty-third session](#), 4 July 2013, CRC/C/ISR/CO/2-4.

consequently denied access state services and basic infrastructure, such as electricity, drinking water, paved roads and sewerage,⁵² in violation of their rights to health and food security.⁵³

Article 24 of the Convention on the Rights of the Child guarantees children the right to the highest attainable standard of health and access to medical centers. Very often, Palestinian Bedouin children in Israel lack access to medical care due to the lack of on-site medical clinics in their towns and villages, while there are such clinics in almost every Jewish-Israeli town and village in the country. In a number of non-Bedouin Palestinian towns and villages, children are also not afforded adequate medical care, for instance, in 2017, Adalah filed a petition to the Israeli Supreme Court to reopen the ‘mother and child’ clinic in the village of Ras Ali in the Haifa district, after the Ministry of Health (MOH) shut it down. Prior to its closure, the clinic was providing perinatal and post-natal care to about 1,500 Palestinian residents. As a result of its closure, women and children in the village of Ras Ali did not have local access to any health clinic whatsoever, a problem that was compounded by the fact that the village is also not supported by public transportation.⁵⁴ In 2018, the Supreme Court rejected the petition, leaving mothers and their children unable to receive medical care.⁵⁵ In a similar case, in 2015, Adalah sent a letter to the MOH demanding that another mother-and-child clinic, this time in the Bedouin village of Abu Tlul, be reopened. The clinic, which served around 130 families, was closed due to a broken generator, which the MOH refused to repair or replace.

The prevalence of food insecurity is also significantly higher among Palestinian children than Jewish Israelis, with the Bedouin in the Naqab faring far worse. In 2021, 16.2% of all families in Israel suffered from food insecurity, while 42.4% of Palestinian families in Israel suffer food insecurity - a rate almost three times greater.⁵⁶ The gap is even more staggering taking into account the fact that only 11% of Jewish-Israeli families suffer from food insecurity. In 2021, Adalah made demands to Israeli government ministries in response to the unfair distribution of the *kamcha depascha* grants, which are part of the Jewish custom of providing the needy with financial assistance and/or food supplies before certain Jewish holidays. In 2019, according to the Israeli Ministry of Labor, Social Affairs, Social Services, only 8,585 shekels (~US\$2,600) were

⁵² See, e.g., [Arab Bedouin schools in the Naqab remain without electricity; national electricity company now blames the war](#), 1 September 2014.

⁵³ See, e.g., in 2019, Adalah [challenged](#) the unreasonably high and unlawful water prices paid by Bedouins in unrecognized villages in the Naqab; see also Adalah Press Release, [Adalah Appeals to Water Tribunal to Connect Arab Bedouin Unrecognized Villages in the Naqab to the Water Network](#), 26 September 2011.

⁵⁴ See Adalah Press Release, [Adalah petitions Israeli Supreme Court to reopen mother and child clinic shuttered by Health Ministry in Arab village](#), 13 August 2017.

⁵⁵ See Adalah Press Release, [Arab mothers, infants unable to access health care after Israeli Supreme Court rejects Adalah petition](#), 25 February 2018.

⁵⁶ See Adalah Statement, [End poverty and create ‘zero hunger’ among Palestinians in Israel](#), 17 October 2022; Publication by the National Insurance Institute of Israel presenting findings of food security survey in Israel in the first half of 2021, NII [English] Press Release available at [522 thousand families live in food insecurity, half of them in severe food insecurity](#) (17 January 2023).

funneled to a Palestinian aid organization, less than 0.1 percent of the overall publicly-funded *kamcha depascha* grant (approximately nine million shekels – ~US\$2.8 million – annually).⁵⁷

Adalah calls on the Committee to urge Israel to take urgent measures to end poverty and ensure zero hunger, especially among Palestinian and Bedouin children.

Adalah urges the Committee to ensure that governmental action be taken to ensure food security is distributed equitably and to eliminate racial discrimination in the provision of funds intended to decrease poverty and food insecurity.

Ban on Family Unification Repercussions (Articles 2, 7, 8, 9, 10, 16, 26 of the CRC)

In its concluding observations from 2013, the Committee voiced grave concerns that “thousands of Palestinian children are deprived of their right to live and grow up in a family environment with both of their parents or with their siblings and that thousands live under the fear of being separated because of the severe restrictions on family reunification under the Citizenship and Entry into Israel Law”.⁵⁸ The Committee also urged Israel to take immediate measures to ensure that Palestinian children are reunited with their families; that all family members are officially registered to avoid any risk of separation; and to revoke the ban on family unification law. Since, other UN human rights treaty bodies have repeatedly criticized the law, and called on Israel to revoke it and to facilitate family unification:

In 2022, the **Human Rights Committee** recommended “that the State party revoke the Citizenship and Entry into Israel Law (Temporary Order), with a view to removing disproportionate and adverse restrictions on the right to family life” (para. 45, CCPR/C/ISR/CO/5).

In 2019, the **Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights** recommended that Israel review the law “with a view to bringing it into line with its obligations under article 10 of the Covenant and to facilitating the exercise of family reunification for all citizens and permanent residents irrespective of their status or background” (para. 41, E/C.12/ISR/CO/4).

In 2017, the **Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women** reiterated its call on Israel from 2011 to review the law in order to facilitate family reunification of all citizens and permanent residents of Israel, and to bring the law into compliance with the CEDAW Convention, while respecting the principles of equality and proportionality (para. 41, CEDAW/C/ISR/CO/6).

The law bans the unification of Palestinian families in Israel by sweepingly denying the right to acquire Israeli residency or citizenship status to Palestinians from the West Bank and the Gaza Strip who are married to Palestinian citizens of Israel. The ban affects thousands of Palestinian

⁵⁷ See Adalah’s Press Release, [Adalah demands Arab aid groups receive fair share of Israeli government's 'kamcha depascha' grants](#), 6 April 2021.

⁵⁸ Committee on the Rights of the Child, [Concluding observations on the second to fourth periodic reports of Israel, adopted by the Committee at its sixty-third session](#), 4 July 2013, CRC/C/ISR/CO/2-4.

families and tens of thousands of people. The children of these families suffer some of the most severe consequences of the aftermath of this law in every aspect of their lives.⁵⁹

The Law was designed to produce separate citizenship tracks for the spouses of Jewish Israeli citizens and the spouses of Palestinian citizens of Israel and systematically results in grave violations of affected Palestinian children, in violation of the right to family life and rights enshrined in this convention, including Article 9, which stipulates that “a child shall not be separated from his or her parents against their will”.

On 10 March 2022, the Knesset re-enacted the Citizenship and Entry into Israel Law (Temporary Order), 2022, also known as the “Ban on family unification law”, for the 22nd time, making clear that its alleged ‘temporary nature’ is purely rhetorical.⁶⁰ In March 2022, Adalah petitioned against the law, demanding that the Law be revoked, as it is discriminatory on its face, violates fundamental constitutional rights, and is contrary to international Law. The Supreme Court held a hearing in December on the nine petitions filed against the law and requested the Knesset and government to respond within 90 days as to their willingness to make minor changes to the law.⁶¹

Since enacting this law for the first time in 2003, Israel has instituted a policy concerning the registration of children in the Population Registry, under which requests for registration will be considered in the context of a request for family unification.⁶²

The law has grave adverse effects to Palestinian children in all aspects of life. Since the law bars Palestinian parents from the OPT from obtaining legal status, and, for certain age groups, even temporary residency permits, children often live only with one of the parents and are separated from the other. Even in families whereby a Palestinian parent from the OPT was able to obtain a temporary permit, those have to be constantly renewed and, *inter alia*, heavily restrict, if not prohibit altogether, a parent’s ability to work in Israel. This creates an environment of instability, constant tension and, oftentimes, financial difficulties and adversely affects childrens’ access to services, including health and education. For instance, a six-year-old boy from the Palestinian village of Iksal was denied access to school by authorities, due to the fact that he did not have an Israeli ID, as his father is a Palestinian from the West Bank. Eventually, and after Adalah’s legal intervention, the child was allowed to enroll in school. In a similar case, a one-year-old’s parents’ request to enroll him in daycare was rejected because his father is a Palestinian citizen of Israel and his mother holds a Palestinian ID card, despite the fact that the child was born in Israel, has lived in there since his birth, and holds a temporary Israeli ID number.⁶³

⁵⁹ See [Citizenship and Entry into Israel Law \(Temporary Order\) – 2022](#).

⁶⁰ See Adalah’s Press Release, [Israel Reinstates Ban on Palestinian Family Unification](#), 10 March 2022.

⁶¹ Citation: HCJ 1777/22 Adalah – The Legal Center for Arab Minority Rights in Israel v. The Interior Minister. See Adalah Press Release [Israeli Supreme Court requests the Knesset and government respond within 90 days as to their -Adalah](#) (4 December 2022).

⁶² See B’Tselem Report, [Forbidden Families: Family Unification and Child Registration in East Jerusalem](#), January 2004.

⁶³ See [Adalah’s letter to the Israeli Ministry of Education](#) [Hebrew], 2 November 2022.

Adalah calls on the Committee to reaffirm its previous recommendations for Israel to revoke the ban on Palestinian family unification and end all policies which prevent family reunification and violate childrens' rights under this convention.